

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 723

**Title:** Gastrointestinal side effects are common in children with Wilson' s disease treated with zinc sulphate

**Reviewer code:** 00051398

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2012-10-07 16:58

**Date reviewed:** 2013-01-03 15:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please refer to uploaded file under comments to authors

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 723

**Title:** Gastrointestinal side effects are common in children with Wilson' s disease treated with zinc sulphate

**Reviewer code:** 00053746

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2012-10-07 16:58

**Date reviewed:** 2013-01-07 16:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[ Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript "Gastrointestinal side effects are common in children with Wilson's disease treated with zinc sulphate" by Wiernicka A et al. The authors performed a retrospective study on 53 children patients with Wilson's disease treated by zinc sulphate. They conclude that zinc sulphate is related to significant gastrointestinal side effects in 40% treated children leading to the change of treatment regimen in substantial part of patients. The novelty of this study is in the description of Helicobacter negative lesions of gastric mucosa visible at gastroscopy. Despite Wilson disease is a rare condition, hepatogastroenterologists are frequently asked to manage specific conditions in these patients. Hence the studies like paper by Wiernicka et al are of importance. The study group (children) is large compare to available literature data. Comments: Introduction 1. In the line 6: It should be mentioned that liver transplantation is used in "acute liver failure" (instead of ...for severe cases...). 2. In the 3rd paragraph, line 3: The number for citation by "Wiggelinkhuizen" should be given. Materials and methods 3. The method of Helicobacter pylori investigation should be given. If samples for histology were taken, the histology findings of mucosa could be of importance. 4. The authors should give data regarding the abuse of another drugs than for the treatment of WD. Was the abuse of non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs excluded? Results 5. Line 2: It should be mentioned that the mean age 10 yrs is for the whole group of patients (probably - nor 2.5, neither 17 yrs age for diagnosis is not presented in any patient in Table 1). 6. The authors mentioned that GIT symptoms resolved after proton pump inhibitors. How long was PPI used by these patients? Did the symptoms recurred or not after stopping PPI? Or, was the treatment by PPI continuous? Did the authors observed some adverse events of PPI treatment? 7. In the section "Results" the authors describe the

criteria for non-compliance. How many patients in the whole group fulfilled these criteria and what was the treatment regimen for these patients? 8. The diagnosis of WD was confirmed by genetic testing in most patients. Was there any relationship between the genotype and frequency of zinc side effects? 9. The data regarding the form of WD are not given (i.e. hepatic or neurologic form). Was there any relationship between the phenotypic manifestation of WD and side effect frequency? 10. Some patients with WD have liver cirrhosis even in childhood. It is known that liver cirrhosis is an independent risk factor for ulcer disease. Could the authors give the data regarding the presence of cirrhosis in examined patients? 11. In Table 1 in the 5th column the dosage of zinc in mg should be given. Discussion 12. In discussion the author should try to explain the mechanism of mucosal changes in patients on zinc treatment. It could be also interesting to know, why the changes were exclusively in stomach and no in duodenum. References 13. Ref No.11: the diagnostic score of WD is usually attributed to Ferenci publication in Liver International (Ferenci P, Caca K, Loudianos G, et al. Diagnosis and phenotypic classification of Wilson disease. Liver Int 2003; 23:139-142). 14. Ref 21: The names of authors are not cited correctly.