

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3035

Title: A modified biopsy method is feasible for the tissue diagnosis of gastric subepithelial tumors

Reviewer code: 00159159

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-04-04 23:55

Date reviewed: 2013-04-19 13:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments: A modified biopsy method is feasible for the tissue diagnosis of gastric subepithelial tumors. Discuss an important modified technique to obtain biopsies from gastric subepithelial tumours. Article well written and findings are of practical importance. Minor comments. Article has few grammatical errors which need to be corrected. Abstracts- results - "Mean size was 21.8mm...." Mean size of what?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3035

Title: A modified biopsy method is feasible for the tissue diagnosis of gastric subepithelial tumors

Reviewer code: 00722836

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-04-04 23:55

Date reviewed: 2013-04-27 03:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Please make a comment regarding the technical difficulty of your method and learning curve
2. Please provide a video demonstrating this method

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3035

Title: A modified biopsy method is feasible for the tissue diagnosis of gastric subepithelial tumors

Reviewer code: 01219948

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-04-04 23:55

Date reviewed: 2013-04-28 09:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper reports the usefulness of a mucosal incision with a fixed flexible snare (MIF) and a deep-tissue biopsy for the histological diagnosis of gastric subepithelial tumors. This study is well-designed, but in terms of novelty, this study lacks in new findings. Major comment 1) Similar methods are previously reported. Recently, the paper titled "Mucosal-incision assisted biopsy for suspected gastric gastrointestinal stromal tumors" was published in World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy. It may be necessary to show the difference of this study from the previous reports. 2) Eleven patients were included in this study, and the diagnostic yield of MIF biopsies was 90.9%. Thus, 95% confidence interval of the diagnostic yield would be approximately 60% to 100%. By the same token, although all the complications were successfully managed, 95% confidence interval of the complications would be 0% to 27%. More patients are needed to show the safety and efficacy of this procedure. Minor comment 1) Although gastric leiomyoma is relatively rare, the number of gastric leiomyomas diagnosed in the study was higher than the number of GISTs. Details of the pathological examination should be written.