



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 3541

Title: Xiaotan Tongfu granules contribute to the prevention and healing of stress-induced gastric ulcers in rats

Reviewer code: 00053723

Science editor: x.x.song@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-05-06 09:04

Date reviewed: 2013-05-06 14:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Authors must include a chemical analysis of the formulation. The discussion and conclusions are mere especulations. Authors have to perform experiments with the main pharceutical components of the XTTF. Furthermore, this study was done in a preventive base, i.e., first animals were treated with XTTF and then later they were subjected to stress. Consequently, the results must be interpreted in terms of prevention and not of treatment. This contrasts with the hypothesis of the use of XTTF in the treatment of SU. Furthermore, authors have not discussed the transitory effect of the stress (i.e., after 24 the stressed animals were recovered, so what is the predictive value of the model in situations where a more permanent lesion is developed?



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 3541

Title: Xiaotan Tongfu granules contribute to the prevention and healing of stress-induced gastric ulcers in rats

Reviewer code: 00034993

Science editor: x.x.song@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-05-06 09:04

Date reviewed: 2013-05-08 20:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

In this study, the authors investigated whether the XTTF granule could be applied as a prophylactic for stress ulcers. Important point of this study is to show that the XTTF granule was similar to ranitidine treatment with regard to reducing gastric lesions, and the underlying mechanism may include acceleration of the GER, inhibition of local inflammation, promotion of cell proliferation and suppression of apoptosis. This study is interesting. However, this study includes any problems. Major comments: 1. In general, H. pylori infection relates with development of peptic ulcer. Therefore, authors should mention H. pylori infection. 2. Why authors select ranitidine, not PPI? Recently, most of cases with acid related diseases was dosed PPI, not histamine 2receptor antagonist. 3. Reviewer cannot agree contents in 2nd paragraph in Introduction. First line treatment of stress ulcer related with H. pylori infection was PPI. 4. What was new finding in this study? Did you have difference of prevalence of H. pylori virulence factors for gastric cancer patients in Iranian previous study? 5. There were many figures. Please summarize or delete any Figures. 6. Authors should discuss more how to inhibit gastric acid secretion by the XTTF granule. 7. Although author said as limitation, it will be required whether the XTTF granule the acts in a dose-dependent manner in part of experiments, not all.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 3541

Title: Xiaotan Tongfu granules contribute to the prevention and healing of stress-induced gastric ulcers in rats

Reviewer code: 00188626

Science editor: x.x.song@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-05-06 09:04

Date reviewed: 2013-05-21 05:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The authors compare the effects of a traditional Western treatment to prevent stress ulcers, ranitidine, with that of a decoction of traditional Chinese medicine (xiaotan tongfu) in rats subjected to cold restraint stress. Because the decoction was composed of 12 herbal components, it is unclear which one(s) or which combinations produced the efficacious results. A more detailed discussion of possible mechanisms for the effects seen, based on knowledge about the actions of the included components in the decoction, should be included. A long list of physiological and biochemical indices were used to evaluate the treatments, but the rationale for each was not presented, although they could be deduced from the discussion. The rationale for using each should be presented in either the introduction or the materials and methods sections. Reviewing would be made easier by numbering both the pages and the lines in the manuscript so that pointing the authors to questions would be easier. Table 1: It would be helpful for the Western reader if common names for the components were also included: rhubarb, bitter orange, magnolia bark, peony, snake-needle grass, citron fruit extract, liquorish root, etc. "Drug administration" paragraph: What is meant by "twice that of an adult dose"? Adult human? What is meant by "adaptive feeding"? "Induction of stress ulceration" paragraph: "model used in the present study". Following onto the next page, why were all of these tests performed? (PCNA, MIF, etc.) "Measurement of apoptotic cells" para: What is meant by "terminated buffer"? Is "DNase" correct? "The apoptotic index was defined....." Figures: Provide a clear explanation of what is meant by the various statistical comparison symbols used (*, #) - what



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

is compared to what? “Gastric pH in the XP and RP groups” para: It is unclear what is meant by “complex pathological variations of body”. Since there is only one figure caption for figures 4-6, they should be renumbered as Figures 4A, 4B, and 4C. Then figures 7 and 8 would be Figures 5A and 5B, and figures 9 and 10 would be Figures 6A and 6B, and figures 11 and 12 would become Figures 7A and 7B. “Discussion”, para 2: Suggest replacing “(article under review)” with “(unpublished observations)”. 2 para before “Conclusion”: “Though previous studies....our study showed that the effect....” This sentence is unclear. What are potential drawbacks with this use of this ulcer model?