

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2671

Title: Proposal of new classification for hepatocellular carcinoma patients based on tumor characteristics

Reviewer code: 02461868

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-03-07 14:27

Date reviewed: 2013-03-12 00:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Highly clinically relevant study for classifying HCC and likely to lead to earlier detection. The grammar and English need to be corrected. Examples: The first sentence of the introduction is a fragment and should be corrected. In the introduction the word "malignancy" should read "malignant".. Two hundred and eighty-eight in patient section. A full editing is required.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2671

Title: Proposal of new classification for hepatocellular carcinoma patients based on tumor characteristics

Reviewer code: 01219188

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-03-07 14:27

Date reviewed: 2013-04-03 18:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript entitled "Proposal of new classification for hepatocellular carcinoma patients based on tumor characteristics" submitted by Zhu CH et al presents a new staging system for surgically resectable hepatocellular carcinomas from a point of growth styles, i.e. expansive, invasive and disseminative. The prognostic significance of the new staging method was confirmed by the detailed statistical analysis of 288 patients treated in a single facility, being compared with other staging systems previously proposed. The data are novel and seem to be intriguing for most gastroenterologists. However, there are some points to be improved in the manuscript. Major points. 1. The definition of the invasive growth such as satellite nodules (including perforation of the tumor encapsulation) and nodules fusion (including diffuse growth lack tumor encapsulation) is not concrete. It is recommended to demonstrate clearly with representative figures. 2. As to the disseminative growth, the definition of vascular involvement is not concrete, either. It should be delineated what size of vessels are involved 3. To facilitate for readers to understanding the new staging system, stage I to IV is summarized with proper cartoons. Minor points. 1. For the title, "tumor growth characteristics" is more suitable for the content.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2671

Title: Proposal of new classification for hepatocellular carcinoma patients based on tumor characteristics

Reviewer code: 00188649

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-03-07 14:27

Date reviewed: 2013-04-12 15:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Proposal of new classification for hepatocellular carcinoma patients based on tumor characteristics" reported a new appropriate staging system classification of HCC. In this study, these data enable a new staging system, the Expansive - Invasive - Disseminative growth staging classification, to be proposed. However, data are insufficient to support the conclusions. In the paper, the classification of HCC was just according to the survival analysis, other characters should be added like pathomorphological classification, molecular features, the character of gene expression and so on. The analysis did not remove the influences of these factors and treatment strategies on patients' prognosis. Moreover, the Expansive - Invasive - Disseminative growth staging classification is not different from early - medium - late stages, and is impossible to be superior to TNM classification in diagnosis of HCC.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2671

Title: Proposal of new classification for hepatocellular carcinoma patients based on tumor characteristics

Reviewer code: 00069464

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-03-07 14:27

Date reviewed: 2013-04-14 21:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This clinical study is interesting and novel. The author found a simply and efficacy prognostic model for postoperative patients with HCC. Some problems should be concerned. 1. The title should be revised according to this study. Proposal of new classification for postoperative patients with HCC based on tumor characteristics may be suitable. 2. The abstract on this article, particularly in RESULTS and CONCLUSIONS, is poor. It should be carefully revised. 3. EID stage(I II III IV) characteristics such as age, gender, HBV or HCV infection or antiviral, AFP level and tumor size also should be present respectively, in addition to all HCC patients and tumor characteristics(n = 288) was present in this study.