

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 3292

Title: Changes in fatty acid composition of erythrocyte membrane phospholipids in patients with acute pancreatitis

Reviewer code: 00503540

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-04-21 18:38

Date reviewed: 2013-04-24 00:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

A good study design. Please discuss how to promote this methodology for clinical setting. Characteristics (Table 1) needs statistical analysis using chi-test (add p value).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 3292

Title: Changes in fatty acid composition of erythrocyte membrane phospholipids in patients with acute pancreatitis

Reviewer code: 00057695

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-04-21 18:38

Date reviewed: 2013-04-24 18:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a well conducted prospective study, and to my knowledge this is the first study that examines the fatty acid profile of the erythrocyte membrane in acute pancreatitis. However, its routine applicability in clinical practice is yet to be determined. Moreover, like changes that are witnessed in the measurement of serum fatty acids, such changes may be secondary to pancreatitis (i.e. consequences) rather than 'triggering factors'. Further studies are needed to answer this issue.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 3292

Title: Changes in fatty acid composition of erythrocyte membrane phospholipids in patients with acute pancreatitis

Reviewer code: 00053888

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-04-21 18:38

Date reviewed: 2013-04-24 20:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a well written study with an interesting hypothesis and results. The message is clear and valid, the application is a little more difficult to foresee but never the less the data is worth publishing.