



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3122

Title: Disparities of conjugating protective enzyme activities in the colon of patients with adenomas and carcinomas

Reviewer code: 02446446

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-04-10 09:57

Date reviewed: 2013-04-23 06:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to authors: -The manuscript of “Disparities of conjugating protective enzyme activities in the colon of patients with adenomas and carcinomas “ is quite interesting and makes an acceptable case for publication, considering that little reports were published on this subject. However, there are some items in the paper which should be considered. -Hoensch H. and coauthors represent a study of 48 patients of which 28 had adenomas and 20 had colorectal carcinomas for the purpose investigating the activity of 2 conjugating enzymes- (UGT) &(GST) in the biopsies of uninvolved mucosa of the colon. -The paper mainly presents two key contributions: 1-The idea that susceptibility to develop colorectal cancer may depend on the metabolic enzymatic capacity of the colon mucosa to detoxify noxious carcinogenic compounds. 2- The notion that Conjugating phase II enzymes could protect the colonic mucosa from mutagenic insults. -The authors present some experimental results on enzyme assays using 4-nitrophenol (UGT) and 1-chloro 2, 4-dinitrobenzene (GST) as substrates, and the statistical analysis of variance (F-test) indicated that both (the 2 conjugating enzymes) were more widely distributed in adenoma than in cancer patients. -I have the following Comments : 1-Please discuss any study limitation and provide prospect for further study. 2-In the methods section, please discuss the inclusion and exclusion criteria. 3-In the results section: You are starting the first paragraph with a statement: “ Table 1 shows the patients demographic characteristics.....” . I think the editors will consider that as a weak design and inappropriate format for this section. It’s better to move the sentence (mentioned above) to the second paragraph of the section. 4-Please clarify the following : -Page 5, the last paragraph: “ For some patients not enough biopsy material was obtained to perform the complete set of enzyme



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

assays (see Figure 1) “ . -Page 9, the second paragraph: “ The degree of neoplasia was associated with the enzyme levels and with an increased variance in the polyp patients. On the other hand the enzyme levels could inform on the degree of neoplasia and its evolution” . 5-Please pay attention to the typographical and spelling errors in the text: page 5,6,7,8,9,10 and figures 1, such as : Fiftyone, Sigma, nicotin, femal, etc..... 6-Reference # 19 is not cited in the text. 7-Table (1) legend: provide more enough details to allow reader to understand the table. 8-Figure (1) & (2) legends: provide more enough details to allow reader to understand the figure.