

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 00503464

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-16 16:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS: In this manuscript, the authors performed meta-analysis in regard to the role of Helicobacter pylori infection on esophageal cancer risk. The manuscript has a potential and I have no concern in this manuscript. Comment 1) Please add the following paper to the reference and discuss in more detail. Takeshi Matsuhisa, Taku Tsukui. Relation between reflux of bile acids into the stomach and gastric mucosal atrophy, intestinal metaplasia in biopsy specimens. J Clin Biochem Nutr. Vol. 50 (2012) No. 3 ? Handa O, Naito Y, Yoshikawa T. Redox biology and gastric carcinogenesis: the role of Helicobacter pylori. Redox Rep. 2011;16(1):1-7.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 01436291

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-23 22:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

These researchers performed a meta-analysis to clarify the association between Helicobacter pylori infection and development of esophageal carcinoma. The results obtained could be interesting. However, there are so many grammatical and punctuation errors all through the manuscript that it is sometimes difficult even to understand the meaning of sentences. I therefore suggest to submit the text to someone whose mother tongue is English and then to resubmit the manuscript.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 01429020

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-25 02:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study of Fa-Jun Xie et al reports an updated meta-analysis between esophageal cancer and H. pylori association. The main finding is the possibility that a different result may be observed when the analyzed studies are divided into Western and Eastern investigations. An association between infection and esophageal squamous cell carcinoma was found in Eastern, but not in Western countries. Additionally, CagA positivity reduced the possibility of this association. The main remark which may be moved to this study and is suggested to emphasize in the Discussion is that factors other than a gastric bacterial infection could be involved such as the use of hot food and beverage already invoked for several years. Nutritional habits may also be referred to the difference between Western and Eastern findings, but it is unlikely that nutrient absence and a consequent malnutrition may be a great problem in Eastern Countries where the selected studies have been performed. In the case a possible malnutrition is considered a relevant problem by the Authors, it must be supported by nutritional status parameters (BMI, cutaneous plicometry) from these countries. Finally, a convincing explanation excluding a casual rather than a causal relationship between the observed relationship may be reported. A second remark concerns the need of a linguistic revision for many typing mistakes and some grammar faults.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 00183459

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-25 15:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a meta-analytic study aimed at assessing whether H. pylori infection and CagA-positivity may be inversely related to the occurrence of esophageal carcinoma. Overall, there is no association for the esophageal squamous cell carcinoma (ESCC) risks except for Eastern people. Similarly, CagA positive infection may decreased the risk of ESCC in the Eastern people but did not reach a statistical significance in Western population. For Esophageal adenocarcinoma, H. pylori infection seems to show a protective role. The study is very interesting and the results may be of relevance. There are, however, some spelling errors; this manuscript needs to be reviewed by a mother tongue translator.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 00069819

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-27 01:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is well written, although extensive English language revision is required. I have the following comments/suggestions: 1. Title: i suggest to change "update meta-analysis" to simply "meta-analysis". 2. Keywords should be stated at the bottom of the abstract. 3. The introduction is too long. Ideally, the introduction section should not exceed 2 short paragraphs. I suggest that some of the details appearing in this section should be relocated in the discussion section. 4. The references should be increased to include all reviewed, relevant articles.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 02520448

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-29 02:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor / Author It is a very useful and interesting study. The results are very important and create other questions in mind that lead to further studies. However, there are numerous grammar mistakes. Therefore, the manuscript should be revised by a person whose native language is English. After revision, the manuscript seems suitable for publication. Regards.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4111

**Title:** Helicobacter pylori Infection and Oesophageal Cancer Risk: an update Meta-Analysis .

**Reviewer code:** 00503587

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-06-16 09:25

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-29 05:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Xie et al provides a meta-analysis of the potential association between the gastric pathogen *Helicobacter pylori* and oesophageal cancers. Comments 1. The manuscript features a large number of errors of grammar, spelling or English language construction. These must all be remedied. 2. The unstructured abstract gives a good overview of the work 3. The name of the gastric pathogen, *Helicobacter pylori* should be presented correctly, using standard accepted formats, throughout the manuscript 4. A flow chart to illustrate the search process and approach to the works included and excluded would be advantageous 5. The presentation of the sections of the manuscript could be revised to improve readability 6. Figure legends should be enhanced to improve understanding. Table legends should also be improved.