

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3403

Title: Prospective study of HBV reactivation in haematological malignant patients in Egypt

Reviewer code: 00036463

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-04-28 20:20

Date reviewed: 2013-05-10 20:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Prospective study of HBV reactivation in haematological malignant patients in Egypt Authors: Elkady, et al. Elkady et al. investigated the HBV reactivation in Egyptian patients with hematological diseases. In their study, 9.4 % and 27% of the whole and anti-HBc-positive population experienced HBV reactivation after chemotherapy. Taking into consideration such a high incidence of reactivation, the authors concluded that the mandatory serological screening and close monitoring should be done before and during/after the therapy. The manuscript is easy to read. In the study, performance of sequencing and molecular analysis of HBV genomes seems relevant in characterization of the strains associated with HBV reactivation. However, there are some issues that need to be clarified for the study conclusions. 1. The authors stated that it is a prospective study in the title. However, no descriptions indicating ‘prospective nature of the study’ are seen in the manuscript. 2. In this study, testing for HBV DNA and HBsAg seemed to be done only in patients showing ALT elevation. How could they detect HBV reactivation in the 3 patients with normal ALT levels (case 1, 3, and 5 in Table 2)? With such monitoring strategies, can the authors explain the higher incidence of HBV reactivation in this study, when compared to those in other studies (Hui et al., Matsue et al., and other relevant studies)?—It seems that frequent monitoring would have been done during therapy to detect reactivation?. What are the median time and interval for monitoring of HBV DNA or HBsAg in the patients? 3. Table 2: The authors would provide the quantitative data (IU/ml or copies/ml) of HBV DNA levels, rather than the qualitative results (for both before and after treatment). A brief description on St. Jude protocol should be added (possibly as a footnote to the table). Are there test results for HBeAg/ Ab in the patients? 4. Discussion, the second para in page 11: The analysis of HBV genomic characterization would be informative, but not all reactivation cases



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

can be explained with viral genomic analysis. Based on previous publications on HBV reactivation, it can potentially occur in any patients receiving immunosuppressive therapy, irrespective of geographical area, HBV genotypes or mutations. Also in this study, only 2, 1, and 3 cases showed genomic variants in the core promoter, precore and S gene product, respectively. The results should be interpreted with caution, without a direct comparison with data in patients with pre-existing mutants before treatment but without reactivation during/after treatment. 5. Reference styles and some grammatical errors in the manuscript need to be corrected.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3403

Title: Prospective study of HBV reactivation in haematological malignant patients in Egypt

Reviewer code: 00646227

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-04-28 20:20

Date reviewed: 2013-05-13 17:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

MS# 3403

Title: Prospective study of HBV reactivation in haematological malignant patients in Egypt

Elkady et al investigated the reactivation of HBV in 53 hematological malignant patients receiving chemotherapy. Five (9.4%) were defined with reactivation, and all were anti-HBc positive before. The HBV in the five patients was genotype D1, and 2 of them had precore mutation A1896 and basal core promoter mutation T1764/G1766 mutation.

In general, the results are valuable to understand the HBV reactivation in patients who have resolved HBV infection (HBsAg negative/anti-HBc positive). However, the manuscript is very poor written. There are so many redundancies in the manuscript (in the text, and between the text and tables/figures). The manuscript requires extensive editing. Then it may be considered as a short report.

Specific comments:

1. The Title is too 'big'; the article contained only 53 patients from a hospital, and the data can not represent those in 'Egypt'.
2. The Abstract and Discussion are too lengthy.
3. There are numerous inappropriate expressions throughout the manuscript, such as
 - ◆ "co infected" should be "co-infected"

- ◆ “Denovo” ... “De novo”
 - ◆ “anti-HBsAb” ... “anti-HBs”
 - ◆ “anti-HBcAb” ... “anti-HBc”
 - ◆ Many others
4. The P values, rather than ‘NS’, should be presented in Table 1.
 5. The detailed data about the HBV reactivation are absent:
 - ◆ How long had each patient been treated with chemotherapy before he/she experienced HBV reactivation?
 - ◆ Did the Patients 1, 3, and 5 in Table 2 ever have abnormal liver function tests?
 - ◆ Have the Patients 2 and 5 in Table 2 recovered from elevated ALT? how long?
 - ◆ Did the reactivated patients receive anti-HBV therapy?
 - ◆ How about the short-term and long-term outcomes in the 5 reactivated patients?
 6. Figure 1 may be more compacted: Anti-HBc – α -HBc, ..., positive – (+), negative – (-), etc.
 7. Figure 2 does not provide important information, and may be omitted.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3403

Title: Prospective study of HBV reactivation in haematological malignant patients in Egypt

Reviewer code: 00632014

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-04-28 20:20

Date reviewed: 2013-05-15 21:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have focused on the reactivation of HBV in patients with HBsAg negative before receiving chemotherapy for hematological malignancies in Egypt. They observed that 9.4 % of HBsAg-negative patients experienced the HBV reactivation. They observed escape mutation in four out of five. All HBV reactivation were observed in anti HBc positive patients. They claimed the significance of ant-HBc screening to identify high-risk patients of HBV reactivation. Their findings are significant and beneficial for the readers. Minor points; References should be appropriately described. 1. No information was shown about [Attia.,1998 and Khattab et al.,2010] in line 21 of page 4. 2. [year] after author are unnecessary in line 11, 15 and 18 of page 10 & in line 24 and 1 of page 11 and 12, respectively.