

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3929

Title: Effect of siRNA mediated knockdown of COX-2 and p65 on Snail and E-Cadherin in gastric cancer cells

Reviewer code: 02461125

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-06-04 14:38

Date reviewed: 2013-06-08 09:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Liu et al described the study on the regulatory role of Cox-2 in NF- κ B/Snail signaling as well as the expression of E-cadherin, the downregulation of which is implicated in tumor invasion. Through inhibition or Cox-2, activation of Cox-2 downstream signaling via PGE₂, or knockdown of NF- κ B, they examined the altered expression of Snail and E-cadherin, concluding that in gastric cancer cells, Cox-2 activates NF- κ B to upregulate Snail, which in turn repressed the expression of E-cadherin. The results presented by the authors are beneficial to elucidating the mechanism underlying Cox-2-mediated cancer progression and metastasis. However, the data are not convincing yet and further study is probably needed in order to get the conclusion the authors claimed. Major points: 1. Although the detailed experiments and data may vary significantly, the purpose and conclusion of this study is very similar to the corresponding author's published results (Chen et al. Int J Mol Med, 2013; 32:93-100). Authors should address the major difference between the two studies. 2. Fig. 3 contains data which may be inconsistent with the suggested Cox-2/PGE₂/NF- κ B/Snail/E-cadherin pathway. For example, given that NF- κ B acts downstream of PGE₂, when comparing lane 5 with lanes 3 and 1, decreased Snail and upregulated E-cadherin are anticipated; when comparing lane 3 with lane 1, Snail should be increased while E-cadherin should be downregulated. Neither of these alterations was actually observed in Fig. 3. In addition, "scramble siRNA" is not a definitive label, and "PEG2" should be "PGE₂". 3. Statistical analysis should be performed from Fig. 1 to Fig. 3. Minor points: 1. It is unnecessary to present the sequences of each of the 2 strands of siRNA which are completely complementary. 2. Overexposure of the β -actin blots seems inappropriate for a loading control.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3929

Title: Effect of siRNA mediated knockdown of COX-2 and p65 on Snail and E-Cadherin in gastric cancer cells

Reviewer code: 02523299

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-06-04 14:38

Date reviewed: 2013-06-19 22:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting paper on the molecular biology of COX-2 and E-Cadherin via the NF- κ B and Snail pathways. The methodology and reasoning is sound along with the results and logical discussion at the end. I found some of the dialogue slightly confusing however and I believe this paper would benefit from a less complicated array of figures. Table 1+2 are of no relevance to the reader and could be removed and figures 1, 2+3 could be more polished and user friendly. They do not reproduce well. Take home message and future implications should stand out more.