

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3984

Title: HER2 in gastric cancer: Comparative analysis of three different antibodies using whole-tissue sections and tissue microarrays

Reviewer code: 00003697

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-06-07 19:01

Date reviewed: 2013-06-18 00:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this experimental study, the authors compared the performance of 3 commercially available anti-HER2 Ab in a series of gastric cancers, using both whole tissue sections and tissue microarrays. The paper is well written and of great scientific and clinical value, because it investigates HER2 expression in gastric cancers and the best available methods to detect HER2+ tumors, and therefore it offers new insights for the identification of those patients who could benefit from the use of trastuzumab. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS** The Title accurately reflects the major topic and contents of the study. Abstract: it gives a clear delineation of the research background, objectives, materials and methods, results and conclusions. The innovative and significant points conform to the background, objectives, materials and methods, results and conclusions. Materials and methods: its materials are characterized by adequate sample size; the methods used are innovative and advanced; the design is rational and reliable, and the statistical methods used are appropriate. Results: the results provide sufficient experimental evidence to draw scientific conclusions. Discussion: it is well organized, and systematic theoretical analyses and valuable conclusions are provided. References: the references are appropriate, relevant, and updated. Tables and figures: tables and figures reflect the major findings of the study, and they are appropriately presented.