

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4215

Title: Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease is Associated with Significant Coronary Artery Disease in Koreans:

Reviewer code: 00053684

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-21 14:51

Date reviewed: 2013-06-21 21:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There is an interesting retrospective study that demonstrated that CAD is more frequent in NAFLD patients.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4215

Title: Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease is Associated with Significant Coronary Artery Disease in Koreans:

Reviewer code: 02445063

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-21 14:51

Date reviewed: 2013-06-21 23:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting manuscript but requires significant revision. In results section: First couple of paragraphs are written in a confusing manner. --> Of them, 82 (61.2%) had ultrasonographically diagnosed NAFLD. The majority of the subjects had mild fatty liver (46.3%), whereas 52 (38.8%) had no evidence of fatty liver. {This sentence is confusing} --> The following sentence needs further characterization elaboration of CAD population vs nonCAD. Needs to be revised/paragraph 1 and 2 reworked; does not fit where it is placed. --> In the next sentence-"More diabetes" is confusing-how is this defined? --> The sentence, "In our results, any factors which we concerned were not found to be related to CAD."- is confusing and needs to be rewritten. Under discussion: --> The statements, "In contrast, our study was different from that study because we evaluated not only the presence of fatty liver and CAD but also the degree of fatty liver and severity of CAD. Our results show that angiographically proven coronary artery stenosis was strongly associated with NAFLD in a grade-dependent manner." These are broad and over-reaching- Important to qualify with your results there is no histology/staging of fibrosis or use of elastography/stiffness- which should be included in the discussion. --> The sentence, "In the present study, we also find the clue to elucidate precise mechanism of this relationship."- is poorly written and requires revision to clarify. Tables: Table 2- A comment on the number of post-menopausal women in each group is warranted. Post-menopause is known influence on NAFLD/NASH. In addition- There is no definition of diabetes mellitus a known cause of fatty liver disease is not defined? For other pages of tables- you need to include the title of the table for ease of reading/editing. Table 2- was diabetes, a known cause of NAFLD controlled in the regression? How is "NAFLD defined- assuming it is fat upon sonography" Table 3- Why wasn't there controlling for diabetes/hgbA1c which is a well published association and always controlled for in clinical trials?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4215

Title: Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease is Associated with Significant Coronary Artery Disease in Koreans:

Reviewer code: 00214311

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-21 14:51

Date reviewed: 2013-06-27 02:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Needs major revision as specified in the manuscript

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4215

Title: Nonalcoholic Fatty Liver Disease is Associated with Significant Coronary Artery Disease in Koreans:

Reviewer code: 00503546

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-21 14:51

Date reviewed: 2013-07-02 13:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors investigated whether NAFLD independently affects angiographically proven CAD and which mediator is responsible for this association. This report has enough potential for publication, I think. Comments 1. The patients with fatty liver had more diabetes, authors wrote. Perhaps enrolled patients included some diabetes patients with medication (such as sulfonylurea, glinide and DPP-4 inhibitor). If so, insulin and HOMA-IR may not be evaluated properly. 2. [Result] 1st paragraph: 40.9% in group A → 51.1%, maybe. 3. [Introduction] Many NAFLD studies conducted in Western populations, have found a relationship between NAFLD and CAD in relatively obese patients rather than that in Asians.: Add references. 4. [Figure 1] P=0.002 means what? Figure 1 and Table 1 present the same thing.