Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 4530
Title: Curcumin represents enhanced cytotoxicity to colorectal cancer cells with PTEN deficiency
Reviewer code: 00112124
Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan
Date sent for review: 2013-07-04 14:38
Date reviewed: 2013-07-16 18:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
The authors have investigated the effects of PTEN knockout in HCT-116 colorectal cancer cells on the cytotoxicity of chemotherapy and the natural agent curcumin. They found that PTEN negativity did not affect the cytotoxic effects of several chemotherapeutic agents, but did affect the cytotoxicity of curcumin on HCT-116 cells. Upon further investigation they found that this effect is related to increased G0/G1 arrest and not to increased apoptosis. The manuscript is consistent and well structured, but English style and spelling (including the title) should be reworked. In the abstract, the authors should mention in the results that PTEN knockout did not affect the cytotoxicity of CPT-11, 5-FU, oxaliplatin, or DHA.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 4530
Title: Curcumin represents enhanced cytotoxicity to colorectal cancer cells with PTEN deficiency
Reviewer code: 01327790
Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan
Date sent for review: 2013-07-04 14:38
Date reviewed: 2013-07-13 20:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[Y] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript investigated, first time, the effects of PTEN deficiency on the cytotoxicity of curcumin for colorectal cancer cells. However, there are four major problems in this manuscript. Major comments 1. The manuscript attempted to demonstrate that the functional status of the PTEN gene effected on curcumin cytotoxicity for CRC cells, but the authors had not described the mechanism of curcumin cytotoxicity. Why they did not choose the other tumor suppressor gene, for example, P53 gene, to investigate the relationship between the gene function and curcumin cytotoxicit. 2. The authors developed ?the isogenic set of human CRC cells? that differ only in their PTEN status, PTEN+/+, PTEN+/-and PTEN-/-, but they did not describe the characteristic differences of these cells that they developed. 3. The mechanism elaborated unclearly. The results in this manuscript indicated that PTEN deficiency could change the curcumin-induced cell cycle arrest pattern and resulte in an increased sensitivity of HCT116 cells to curcumin. Although the authors showed us the different expression levels of P21, Cyclin D1, Cyclin B1, Cdc2 and p-Akt between the PTEN+/+and PTEN-/- cells. However, these are not sufficient for the explanation of curcumin cytotoxicit differences in these cells 4. Insufficiency citation for the research literatur. The results in ths manuscript showed that curcumin exposure led to a marked G2/M phase cell cycle arrest in the cells with wide-type PTEN and a significant G0/G1 phase arrest in PTEN-/- cells. But the authors had not cited this publication that showed “curcumin can induces G1/S arrest, suppresses proliferation, and induces apoptosis in mantle cell lymphoma” (Biochem Pharmacol. 2005; 70:700-13). Minor comments The manuscript is full of grammatical errors and awkward sentences. It should be fully revised for the English.