

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4445

**Title:** Estrogen improves the hyperdynamic circulation and hyporeactivity of mesenteric arteries by alleviating oxidative stress in PPVL rats

**Reviewer code:** 02446589

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-01 15:29

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-05 15:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

**GENERAL COMMENTS** This study presents interesting data that shows whether estrogen can attenuate the severity of hyperdynamic circulation in PHT rat model with a focus on oxidative stress. Authors suggested that mesenteric arteriole sensitivity and contractility in response to NE were decreased in PPVL rats, and E2 treatment ameliorated these parameters significantly. Finally, they further showed that functional improvement in the contractile response achieved by E2 administration is due most probably to improvements in oxidative stress. This message is important and provides new insight in understanding the etiology of PTH. Presentation of data and readability of the manuscript is very good. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS** Firstly, the title reflects the content of the study accurately. The hypothesis is established in comprehensible way and material and methods are convenient. The article clearly and coherently explained. All sections are well-developed. Findings of the study were explained clearly and tables and figures presented appropriately. Results are also consistent with the hypothesis and literature. The article is well-written and easy to understand. The article contains the entire components included introduction, methods, theory, analysis. However the discussion part could be more structured and therefore should be improved to fortify the significance of the study.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4445

**Title:** Estrogen improves the hyperdynamic circulation and hyporeactivity of mesenteric arteries by alleviating oxidative stress in PPVL rats

**Reviewer code:** 02446789

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-01 15:29

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-18 02:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Estrogen improves the hyperdynamic circulation and hyporeactivity of mesenteric arteries by alleviating oxidative stress in PPVL rats" by Bin Zhang and colleagues" is an interesting manuscript with novel observations. In this manuscript, authors delineated the effect of estrogen treatment on the systemic and splanchnic hyperdynamic circulation in portal hypertensive rats. The findings are straight forward and manuscript is well written and nicely discussed. I have no further comments.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4445

**Title:** Estrogen improves the hyperdynamic circulation and hyporeactivity of mesenteric arteries by alleviating oxidative stress in PPVL rats

**Reviewer code:** 00504362

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-01 15:29

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-19 01:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reported that estrogen improves the hyperdynamic circulation. This author has major concerns: In the last paragraph of Introduction Section authors stated that " the aim of the present study was to investigate whether estrogen could attenuate the severity of hyperdynamic circulation and the underlying mechanisms in PHT rats without cirrhosis...In this context, there are previous published data that support the present hypothesis (see Eur J Clin Invest. 2005 Mar;35(3):220-5; Arq Gastroenterol. 2011 Jul-Sep;48(3):211-6. There are no data confirming the efficacy of castration, the weight of uterine horns and/or absence of circulating estrogen. The manuscript is very descriptive and no experimental attempts are made to unravel the underlying mechanisms of improvement induced by estrogen. The addition of experimental data showing that reduction observed in superoxide and hydrogen peroxide is paralleled with the corresponding detoxifying enzymatic systems is highly recommended