

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4110

Title: Overexpression of Nuclear β -catenin in Rectal Adenocarcinoma Is Associated with Radioresistance

Reviewer code: 00039316

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-16 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-06-17 02:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I reviewed with interest the study entitled "Overexpression of Nuclear β -catenin in Rectal Adenocarcinoma Is Associated with Radioresistance". The major issue that should be addressed by the authors is why they selected their population and they excluded patients on chemoradiotherapy which is the standard of neoadjuvant treatment for locally advanced rectal cancer. Therefore, the results of the study cannot be generalized to the majority of the patients and this is a significant limitation of the study. Minor issues: State the retrospective design of the study in the methods. Add a paragraph in the discussion on the limitations of the study, including the design, patients selection, etc. Present the expression of b-catenin also in the surgically resected tumors and compare its expression to that on the biopsies before the radiation. Would this make any change to your results? Clarify what is the exact definition for b-catenin expression and keep it through out the paper. Is it $\geq 50\%$ staining or is it $\geq 50\%$ moderate to strong staining. Discuss the possibility of reaching to different conclusions if you used a different TRG system (there must be at least 4 of them). If your results are not reproducible with the other TRG systems, then it is also a strong limitation of your study. Since you identified 3 predictive factors for radioresistance in your multivariate analysis, you are encouraged to perform a discriminant analysis that will include all 3 factors to form a predictive model for radioresistance.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4110

Title: Overexpression of Nuclear β -catenin in Rectal Adenocarcinoma Is Associated with Radioresistance

Reviewer code: 00058361

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-16 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-06-17 10:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written contribution free of scientific errors. I made some textual changes mainly typo's and spelling issues. See, PDF attached.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4110

Title: Overexpression of Nuclear β -catenin in Rectal Adenocarcinoma Is Associated with Radioresistance

Reviewer code: 00503072

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-16 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-06-27 16:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHOR: Overexpression of nuclear β -catenin in colonic and rectal adenocarcinoma have been well documented before. This study has focused on the association between nuclear β -catenin overexpression and preoperative radioresistance in patients with rectal adenocarcinoma. The authors found that an overexpression of β -catenin in nuclear maybe a useful predictor for preoperative radioresistance in postoperative resected specimens and biopsy. In general, this is a good attempt to study the clinical significance of β -catenin in patients with rectal cancer. But the concerns still remain. 1. The authors used postoperative resected specimens and biopsy to study the predicative significance of β -catenin in patients with rectal cancer received radiotherapy. This is somewhat strange! The clinicians like to know the patients if they are sensitive to the radio therapy before operation, so most studies used preoperative colonoscopic biopsy to study it. Again, the expression and significance of β -catenin in preoperative colonoscopic biopsy and resected specimen obtained from same patient should be compared. 2. The authors claimed "this is the first study to investigate the prognostic value of nuclear β -catenin overexpression for radioresistance in rectal cancer". This is not right. The predicative significance of overexpression of nuclear/membrane β -catenin in rectal cancer received radio therapy has been reported before and a similar manuscript has been published in International Journal of Colorectal diseases 2011, 26(9):1127-1134. 3. Of course there are some misspellings and small mistakes in the text, which should be corrected.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4110

Title: Overexpression of Nuclear β -catenin in Rectal Adenocarcinoma Is Associated with Radioresistance

Reviewer code: 00073425

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-16 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-06-28 23:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper presents the role of overexpression of nuclear β -catenin in rectal adenocarcinoma in radioresistance of tumor. This paper is very interesting and the problem is up to date. However, I have one comment. The examined material included 136 patients. I did not find any information concerning neoadjuvant chemoradiotherapy in these patients. It is a routine procedure in this kind of cancers. Does it mean that these patients were excluded from the study. It requires explanation.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4110

Title: Overexpression of Nuclear β -catenin in Rectal Adenocarcinoma Is Associated with Radioresistance

Reviewer code: 00068559

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-16 09:23

Date reviewed: 2013-06-29 11:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors studied the clinical significance of β -catenin overexpression and radioresistance in patients with rectal cancer. Now, preoperative radiotherapy were used especially for patients with locally advanced rectal cancer, aiming not only to improve overall and disease-free survival but also to downstage and reduce tumor volume, which may make sphincter-preserving surgery possible. In this study, all the 136 patients received preoperative radiotherapy and underwent Miles' operation. It would be better to provide the data of the distance from distal margin of rectal cancer to anal edge. And the discussion, the statement in the first paragraph, should make some modification.