

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4154

Title: The Impact of Cirrhosis on Surgical Outcome After Pancreaticoduodenectomy

Reviewer code: 00039143

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-18 15:14

Date reviewed: 2013-07-03 02:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This retrospective study is designed to investigate the role of cirrhosis on pancreatoduodenectomy for malignant disease. The authors demonstrate that wound complications, internal emorragy, pancreatic fistola and hospital mortality increase in the cirrhotic patients group. The authors also report that blood loss and blood transfusion were more significant in cirrhotic patients with portal ipertension. Moreover hospital mortality was higher in child B patients than child A. The manuscript is well done and statistical analysis is appropriate and correct. The authors highlight that the data reported in the manuscript may aid surgeons to recognize among patients requiring pancreatoduodenectomy for malignant disease in pancreatic head and periampollary region, those who may present the best outcome.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4154

Title: The Impact of Cirrhosis on Surgical Outcome After Pancreaticoduodenectomy

Reviewer code: 00505500

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-18 15:14

Date reviewed: 2013-08-05 21:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

RE: ESPS Manuscript NO: 4154 Title: The Impact of Cirrhosis on Surgical Outcome After Pancreaticoduodenectomy The authors retrospectively investigated the surgical outcome of patients with liver cirrhosis undergoing pancreaticoduodenectomy (PD). They conclude that patients with periampullary tumour and well-compensated chronic liver disease should routinely be considered for PD. PD is associated with an increased risk of postoperative morbidity in patients with liver cirrhosis, and therefore it is only recommended in patients with Child A cirrhosis without portal hypertension. This is the large series regarding the surgical outcome of patients with liver cirrhosis undergoing PD. Several comments can be addressed below. Minor comments: #1. Medical terminology "pancreaticoduodenectomy" is appropriate throughout the manuscript. The authors should change "pancreatoduodenectomy" to "pancreaticoduodenectomy". #2. The authors should rewrite the submitted manuscript according to the Instructions for Authors, World Journal of Gastroenterology. Also, the authors should reconsider the paragraphing throughout the manuscript, i.e., in Introduction, the authors should remake 4 paragraphs. In the main text, only one sentence appears on one paragraph. #3. The authors should remake the Tables 1 to 5 according to the Instructions for Authors, World Journal of Gastroenterology and journal style.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4154

Title: The Impact of Cirrhosis on Surgical Outcome After Pancreaticoduodenectomy

Reviewer code: 00506450

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-18 15:14

Date reviewed: 2013-08-06 17:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting paper describing the surgical outcomes of PD in patients with liver cirrhosis. Cirrhotic patients with portal hypertension were associated with poorer outcome than cirrhotic patients without portal hypertension. PD is recommended only in patients with Child A cirrhosis. Therefore, I only have one minor revision to suggest. I would like to know about preoperative, intra-operative and postoperative details in these 4 cirrhotic patients with Child B. In addition, there are grammatical errors which must be corrected.