

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4754

Title: PU.1 silenced DCs prolong the allograft survival in a rat model of intestinal transplantation

Reviewer code: 00227507

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 13:37

Date reviewed: 2013-08-01 00:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript reported effect of silencing PU.1 on immunophenotypes and recipient survival. It is acceptable for publication if the following minor concerns are addressed. 1. If maturation of DCs determines tolerogenicity/immunogenicity why immature DCs did not prolong recipient survival? A discussion on the outcome of the transplantation experiment besides DC maturation would be helpful. 2. Recipient rats that died within three days were regarded as technical failures and excluded from further analysis. It is unclear whether how to tell the difference between technical failure or death due to treatments received prior to the transplantation. 3. Figure 1b showed the reduction in PU.1 expression, but it is unclear how the 85% reduction was quantified. 4. There should be a comparison for histological changes between the siRNA PU.1 DCs group and the controls, rather than describing only changes in the siRNA PU.1 DCs group as in the last paragraph of the result section. 5. Semi-mature or semi-matured? Both forms were used in the manuscript. A consistent expression is needed. 6. In the discussion, it was mentioned that the observed effects in the transplantation were consistent with the increase secretion of IL-10, and a decrease in IL-12p70. However, no data were presented about the levels of IL-10 and IL-12 in the animals. 7. Figure 3. The resolution and contrast of the histological photos are very poor. They are not adequate to show the morphology of lymphocytes. How does the damage (blunting) of villi determined/measured? 8. There are several minor language errors in the manuscript.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4754

Title: PU.1 silenced DCs prolong the allograft survival in a rat model of intestinal transplantation

Reviewer code: 00058388

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 13:37

Date reviewed: 2013-08-06 11:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

no

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4754

Title: PU.1 silenced DCs prolong the allograft survival in a rat model of intestinal transplantation

Reviewer code: 00053645

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-25 08:13

Date reviewed: 2013-08-16 14:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

PU.1 silenced DCs prolong the allograft survival in a rat model of intestinal transplantation

Xu Xingwei et al.

Authors studied the effect of siRNA of PU.1 in vivo and in vitro.

The paper has some problems for acceptance.

1. The article was very rough in experiment and presentation.
2. Introduction, Line 15; What do cDC and pDC mean?
3. Methods, In vitro generation of bone marrow-derived immature DCs, Line 2; Authors wrote "the femoral and tibial were mechanically obtained" What does this sentence mean?
4. Authors must show how they select the sequence for siRNA, or should show the reference.
5. Intestinal transplantation and treatment; Were DCs obtained from Wistar rats or F344 rats?
6. Figure 1A did not have enough information for publication.
7. The quality of all figures was poor.
8. No figure legend was found.