

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5083

Title: Report of the Diagnosis and Systemic Therapy in a Patient with Unusual Early-Stage Sarcomatoid Carcinoma of the Pancreas

Reviewer code: 00001558

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-14 16:52

Date reviewed: 2013-08-16 12:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript shows a case of early-stage Sarcomatoid Carcinoma of the pancreas. They performed immunohistochemical analysis and measured plasma TGFbeta and IL-11 levels and found increased these cytokine levels and EMT-like change. These results may be potentially interesting, but there are some key experimental data missing and some of the results are not convincing. 1. In the abstract, they stated about data of computed tomography. They should show this data or figure in the main text. 2. In the title, they described "Unusual ". What does it mean? Patient with long-term alive? 3. In the patients and methods, they sowed twelve patients with PDAC, but N=20 in Table 2. Please clarify it. 4. Please clarify who is the pathologist? 5. Is there any evidence that the vimentin-positive cells are tumor cells, but not fibroblast? 6. TGFbeta and IL-11 were secreted from tumor cells or tumor stroma? The plasma levels of these cytokines reduced after the surgery?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5083

Title: Report of the Diagnosis and Systemic Therapy in a Patient with Unusual Early-Stage Sarcomatoid Carcinoma of the Pancreas

Reviewer code: 00038617

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-14 16:52

Date reviewed: 2013-08-19 00:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported the rare case of sarcomatoid carcinoma of the pancreas. They examined serum TGF- β , IL-11, and tumor markers. Histopathological and immunohistochemical analysis were performed to characterize this tumor. According to the results, they indicated the pathogenetic mechanism that TGF- β may regulate the EMT in sarcomatoid carcinoma of the pancreas. Although this case is certainly very rare, there are several problems that should be reconsidered as following. (1) The authors only examined serum TGF- β and IL-11. They should confirm the increased production of TGF- β and IL-11 in tumor tissue. Further, they should also represent the serum data after surgical resection. (2) This paper should be written as a case report; "Case report", "Patients and Methods" and "Results" sections should be consolidated. (3) CT or MRI image of this pancreatic tumor should be presented. (4) With regard to Figure 2, the authors should present the references to support their hypothesis. Minor comments (1) In abstract and manuscript, tumor size measured by ultrasonography was written by mistake.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5083

Title: Report of the Diagnosis and Systemic Therapy in a Patient with Unusual Early-Stage Sarcomatoid Carcinoma of the Pancreas

Reviewer code: 02444996

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-14 16:52

Date reviewed: 2013-08-26 13:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments for the paper "Report of the Diagnosis and Systemic Therapy in a Patient with Unusual Early-Stage Sarcomatoid Carcinoma of the Pancreas". In this study, the authors reported a rare case of a patient with Sarcomatoid carcinoma of the pancreas. I found this paper potentially interesting case report, and I recommend that this paper has been received for the publication in WJG.