

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5079

**Title:** Small cell carcinoma of the liver and biliary tract without jaundice : A case report and review of literature

**Reviewer code:** 01428764

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-14 16:09

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-14 21:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript 5079 The Authors report on a case of liver and bile duct small cell carcinoma. They address an important issue on the fact that despite its rarity it should be considered in the differential diagnosis of atypical chest pain. Moreover they review the literature on the prevalence and incidence of extrapulmonary small cell carcinomas and on the treatment as well as the prognosis. The Title reflects the topic and contents of the study. Abstract gives a clear delineation of the case report, including complete background and conclusions. There are no results but a case report which is well written and organized. Discussion provides sufficient evidence of the rarity of the extrapulmonary small cell carcinomas and is well written and organized. References are appropriate, relevant, and updated. Figures reflect the major findings of the study and are appropriately presented.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5079

**Title:** Small cell carcinoma of the liver and biliary tract without jaundice : A case report and review of literature

**Reviewer code:** 00570617

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-14 16:09

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-21 21:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Small cell carcinoma of the liver and biliary tract without jaundice : A case report and review of literature references uses are outdated, only 1/30 references is from after 2007 (6 years ago!) please update references and corresponding text for example: Clinical and therapeutic aspects of extrapulmonary small cell carcinoma.Walenkamp AM, Sonke GS, Sleijfer DT.Cancer Treat Rev. 2009 May;35(3):228-36. Review. reference no 3 is in the middle of the sentence reference 17 is outdated, newer guidelines are available including CT and PET scans. in addition the new WHO guidelines (2010) for neuroendocrine tumors(NET)/neuroendocrine carcinomas (NEC) should be included to classify tumorgrade, negleting the new guidelines make reference 5/18/20 and many others complete obsolete.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5079

**Title:** Small cell carcinoma of the liver and biliary tract without jaundice : A case report and review of literature

**Reviewer code:** 00181428

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-14 16:09

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-25 10:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors mention that to the best of our knowledge, only 10 cases of primary small cell carcinoma of the liver have previously been reported. So the authors should explain more to make conclusion of this diagnosis. 1) The majority of small cell carcinomas occur in the lung, and extrapulmonary small cell carcinoma comprises only 2.5~4% of all small cell carcinoma cases. Differential diagnosis is important to exclude pulmonary small cell carcinoma. In order to exclude this possibility, chest X-ray films and CT, and/or bronchoscopic examination with appropriate biopsies and sputum cytology are required. The patient was initially presenting with atypical chest pain without jaundice. The authors didn't explain why the patient had symptom with negative chest CT scan and sputum cytology. 2) A number of distinct immunohistochemical features associated with extrapulmonary small cell carcinoma, which are potentially important in distinguishing it from hepatic metastasis of small cell lung carcinoma. The authors should state more why the results of previous studies are somewhat inconsistent in this respect. 3) Small cell carcinoma frequently shows distant metastasis, and has a poor prognosis. Patients with small cell lung cancer generally have poor long-term survival. There have been some reported cases of good long-term survival in patients with extrapulmonary small cell carcinoma. How the authors correlate with the patient died 8 weeks after the diagnosis was confirmed.