

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 3877

**Title:** Gastric Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection-from animal model to patient

**Reviewer code:** 00186852

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-30 08:47

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-13 09:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

**Major** This manuscript is very interesting and the purpose “to assess whether the use of porcine models is useful for learning ESD, thus contributing to its subsequent application in patients” is very important for the endoscopists especially in Western. Biggest limitation: This study is personal experience of one endoscopist. The ability and experiences of this endoscopists is various, so this results don’t assure the reproducibility. I think the authors should acknowledge this limitation in a more appropriate way. The important point of this study is learning curve of ESD. The technique for ESD is not only technique of the dissection, but also marking, cutting, and the hemostasis. Especially, hemostasis is very important for ESD. The author should describe about his historical experience of ulcer hemostasis and study and describe about the hemostasis in the in-vivo animal model study and patient study. The author said “It is worthy of mention that even though the training in ESD in porcine models is safe and accessible, it is recommendable to carry out all of the steps suggested before performing this technique in humans.” I strongly agree this opinion, and this trial is very interesting, therefore, at least, the author should examine the learning curves of two or three endoscopists. **Minor** The author should describe conventional EGD, the experience of the colonoscope, the experience of the gastric cancer diagnosis in detail. The information about the standard deviation would be more informative. The simple t-test is not appropriate for this study. It is not clear how patients were selected for ESD treatment. Because of the retrospective study design and the unequal distribution of patients, the paper does not appear to have a very high priority. A randomized trial or plural endoscopists’ study on this subject would be desirable.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 3877

**Title:** Gastric Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection-from animal model to patient

**Reviewer code:** 00035901

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-30 08:47

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-22 20:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors demonstrated the importance a sequential ESD training program. The present study was well-investigated and has an interesting findings. To improve the quality of this paper, the authors should revise it according to the following suggestions; 1) As mentioned in the present study, a sequential ESD training program would be important as the education for endoscopists. However, for ESD treatment of gastric cancer, it should be more important to give them the training of endoscopic diagnosis, especially to diagnose demarcation line between cancer tissue and non-cancerous area. Please discuss about this matter. 2) Usually in Japan, the pattern of early gastric cancer is popular as depressive type, so-called IIC. However, in the present study, the authors performed ESD for patients with IIa type early gastric cancers.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 3877

**Title:** Gastric Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection-from animal model to patient

**Reviewer code:** 00048752

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-30 08:47

**Date reviewed:** 2013-06-28 15:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Although this is an interesting paper, their results is derived from the experience of only one endoscopist and cannot accept as strong evidence.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 3877

**Title:** Gastric Endoscopic Submucosal Dissection-from animal model to patient

**Reviewer code:** 00182422

**Science editor:** Song, Xiu-Xia

**Date sent for review:** 2013-05-30 08:47

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-02 15:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written manuscript. The author described a training program of ESD for early gastric lesions. By using ex vivo and in vivo porcine stomach, the author performed 30 cases of ESD procedures with improving dissection speed in the second half of the training program. The author then applied the technique to 5 patients with early gastric lesions and successfully resected the lesions without complication. For an area in which the prevalence of early gastric lesion is relatively low, this training program is practical and encourageable.