

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2960

Title: A Rare Adult Gastric Duplication Cyst Mimicking as Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumor

Reviewer code: 00068723

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-29 10:28

Date reviewed: 2013-03-31 08:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

Diagnosis of gastric duplication is not strong. The submucosal tumor seemed a gastric erosion. It might be a misdiagnosis. I would like to leave the decision of acceptance to the editor.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This manuscript reported a case of a submucosal tumor. The authors concluded the tumor was a gastric duplication. However, the evidence of the diagnosis is not enough. The authors should clearly describe the definition of gastric duplication. The submucosal tumor should be compared with the definition. If histological or macroscopic findings of the tumor were consistent with the definition, this tumor could be concluded to be a gastric duplication. PubMed search hits several reports on gastric duplication. Most of them show a tumor on the wall of the stomach. Their sizes are 3-5 cm, or larger. Some of them are homogenous mass like GIST with EUS. Histological examination demonstrates cavity lined by mucosa and smooth muscle. Is gastric duplication usually a cause of iron-deficiency anemia? If so, is there any possible mechanism of bleeding from gastric duplication? If not, what do the authors speculate about the cause of the anemia? It would be helpful if the authors describe blood examination, such as hemoglobin, serum Fe. Figure 5. Submucosal area looked edematous. Inflammatory cells seemed infiltrating in submucosa. Infiltrative fluid was seen in the lumen. Is there possibility that the tumor was gastric erosion?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2960

Title: A Rare Adult Gastric Duplication Cyst Mimicking as Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumor

Reviewer code: 00183665

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-29 10:28

Date reviewed: 2013-04-16 01:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

Nice case, although negative staining authors should include immunohistochemistry for c-kit

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Nice case, although negative staining authors should include immunohistochemistry for c-kit

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2960

Title: A Rare Adult Gastric Duplication Cyst Mimicking as Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumor

Reviewer code: 00289433

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-29 10:28

Date reviewed: 2013-04-24 15:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

This is a good teaching case for the practitioners and relatively rare. The case is well presented and I would recommend its publication in the present format.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a good teaching case for the practitioners and relatively rare. The case is well presented and I would recommend its publication in the present format.