

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5858

Title: Liver Transplantation for Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Role of Inflammatory and Immunological State on Recurrence and Prognosis

Reviewer code: 02445866

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 14:05

Date reviewed: 2013-10-05 18:17

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Y] Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | language polishing | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article deals with role of Inflammatory state on HCC recurrence following liver Tx. The topic is of interest and summarizes the most recent data in the field. One has to agree that there is not much evidence behind this review article, however it nicely summarizes known scientific knowledge. I would recommend re-considering and re-designing both tables which are informative, however cumbersome and not "reader friendly". English language needs some minor polishing and text editing. I suggest accepting the manuscript for publication in WJG.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5858

Title: Liver Transplantation for Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Role of Inflammatory and Immunological State on Recurrence and Prognosis

Reviewer code: 02462197

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 14:05

Date reviewed: 2013-10-06 22:33

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

October 6, 2013 World Journal of Gastroenterology ESPS Manuscript NO: 5858 Title: Liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma: role of inflammatory and immunological state on recurrence and prognosis This is an extensive review of the English literature focused on the role of inflammatory markers and of post-transplant immunosuppression in patients with hepatocellular cancer treated with liver transplantation, with particular attention to tumor recurrence and patient prognosis. The present review is really interesting, focusing on a largely unexplored field of liver oncology. The authors provided to report the most recent discoveries in the connection between hepatocellular cancer, inflammatory status and clinical immunosuppression. The paper is well constructed and well written.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5858

Title: Liver Transplantation for Hepatocellular Carcinoma: Role of Inflammatory and Immunological State on Recurrence and Prognosis

Reviewer code: 02437905

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 14:05

Date reviewed: 2013-10-09 06:05

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------------|
| [Y] Grade A (Excellent) | [Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | [Y] Accept |
| [] Grade B (Very good) | [] Grade B: minor language polishing | [] Existed | [] High priority for publication |
| [] Grade C (Good) | [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | [] No records | [] Rejection |
| [] Grade D (Fair) | [] Grade D: rejected | [] Existed | [] Minor revision |
| [] Grade E (Poor) | | [] No records | [] Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor; This article is a very interesting and innovative study. I'm pleased to review this article. I thought that It is suitable for publishing without any revisions.