Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Ms: 3510
Title: SMOOTHELIN, A NEW MARKER TO DETERMINE THE ORIGIN OF LIVER FIBROGENIC CELLS
Reviewer code: 00504232
Science editor: x.x.song@wjgnet.com
Date sent for review: 2013-05-03 20:54
Date reviewed: 2013-05-10 21:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:
The manuscript by Lepreux S et al. hypothesizes the presence of smooth muscle cell-derived myofibroblasts in cirrhotic liver and in hepatocellular carcinoma, based on the expression of the markers alpha-SMA and smoothelin in stromal cells. The study is of potential interest in the field of myofibroblast source and differentiation in a pathological setting. Nonetheless, it could be more convincing if integrated by immunohisyochemistry experiments showing a co-localization of the markers alpha-SMA and smoothelin in the same cell. The immunohistochemistry experiments should be integrated by immunofluorescence analysis of alpha-SMA and smoothelin, to highlight their co-localization in the cytoskeleton of the same cell. The immunohistochemical detection of the fibronectin ED-A isoform, also involved in myofibroblast differentiation, could also be helpful to support the data.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Ms: 3510
Title: SMOOTHELIN, A NEW MARKER TO DETERMINE THE ORIGIN OF LIVER FIBROGENIC CELLS
Reviewer code: 00503628
Science editor: x.x.song@wjgnet.com
Date sent for review: 2013-05-03 20:54
Date reviewed: 2013-05-14 03:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[Y]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:
The report by Leproux and colleagues attempts to demonstrate that during advanced liver fibrotic precesses a subset of myofibroblasts coexpress smoothelin and a-smooth muscle actin, which is a marker of myofibroblasts. The implication is that these cells may originate from vascular smooth muscle cells known to express smoothelin. The report is highly descriptive and there is no conclusive evidence that myofibroblasts do in fact express smoothelin. Colocalization by confocal microscopy or affinity isolation of the cells with an antibody to a surface marker to show the expression of both proteins and/or the corresponding mRNAs may be convincing. At the very least, demonstrating that the antigen is in fact smootheling may be a significant improvement.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Ms: 3510
Title: SMOOTHELIN, A NEW MARKER TO DETERMINE THE ORIGIN OF LIVER FIBROGENIC CELLS
Reviewer code: 00503442
Science editor: x.x.song@wjgnet.com
Date sent for review: 2013-05-03 20:54
Date reviewed: 2013-05-19 21:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:
I read with great interest the manuscript entitled "SMOOTHELIN, A NEW MARKER TO DETERMINE THE ORIGIN OF LIVER FIBROGENIC CELLS". The study is quite interesting and original, although a few orthographical and grammatical errors found throughout the manuscript limit its readability. In addition, the main drawback is the low number of cases investigated by the Authors. The Authors should better highlight the scientific potential value of their study and the clinical impact. Additionally, their conclusion is not sufficiently supported by their experimental design. The main message of the manuscript is the evidence of a new biomarker useful in the study of liver fibrosis and the potential detection of smoothelin in serum taken from patients affected by chronic liver diseases. Furthermore, it might be interesting whether differences in smoothelin expression exist among viral versus metabolic or autoimmune chronic liver diseases. References should be formatted according to the Journal Instructions for Authors.