

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5317

Title: Susceptibility to ulcerative colitis in Hungarian patients determined by gene-gene interactions

Reviewer code: 00073423

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-29 16:23

Date reviewed: 2013-09-03 19:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Abstract 1. Part of the sentence " and IL23R (rs1004819, rs2201841)" replicated twice. Methods: 2. There is no detailed phenotypic data and data for the sample collection (years, participating centers etc.). Authors have a number of other genetic studies using IBD patients, so maybe they can refer to any of those? If it's a new cohort, detailed information about participating centers and collection year is recommended to be included. 3. Selection of SNPs under analysis has to be justified. Why study didn't include rs11209026 SNP in the IL23R region, as it is the most significant hit in the IL23R locus and it has been replicated in the number of GWAS and GWAS meta-analysis? 4. Has positive control (with already known genotypes for the tested SNPs) been included in the PCR-RFLP? Have the primers used been already verified by sequencing? Results. 5. Stratification is the method helping to assess the presence of systematic differences in allele frequencies between subpopulations, i.e. in your case between different IBD5 loci SNP carriers and non-carriers and this doesn't show possible gene-gene interaction. Stratification is mainly applied for SNPs in very complex regions with high LD in order to help to verify the other signals. In your analysis the IBD5 loci wasn't associated with the disease and by stratifying (in other words "eliminating" the effect) by IBD5 loci just showed the same results as your single SNP association analysis, meaning your results were driven by the association of UC with IL23R, but not with co-association with IBD5. I would recommend to remove this analysis from the study, as it doesn't give any new knowledge.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5317

Title: Susceptibility to ulcerative colitis in Hungarian patients determined by gene-gene interactions

Reviewer code: 00646257

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-29 16:23

Date reviewed: 2013-09-05 12:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript presents an interaction analysis of IBD5 and IL23R on inflammatory bowel disease (IBD). The manuscript is well organized. I have the following comments.. 1. Since multiple tests are involved, the authors need to consider multiple comparisons. 2. I wonder if it might be necessary to try other interaction analysis such as multifactor dimensionality reduction (MDR) analysis. 3. The authors need to present some replication results for their findings.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5317

Title: Susceptibility to ulcerative colitis in Hungarian patients determined by gene-gene interactions

Reviewer code: 00009530

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-29 16:23

Date reviewed: 2013-09-05 23:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study addresses the possible interactions between very popular genes associated with IBD in determining an increased risk ratio for ulcerative colitis in a relatively large of population of ulcerative colitis patients and controls from Hungary. The study is reasonably sized to possibly give some hints for the complex study of genetics in IBD. Data that would complete the analysis and also increase the interest of the paper are those addressing possible genotypic-phenotypic interactions. In any case, information on the different types of disease in patients enrolled should be provided. Also, some data regarding the enrollment of controls should be provided (volunteers? blood donors? patients affected by other diseases?) The paper is reasonably written, although it needs quite a bit of language polishing as well as corrections of some typographical errors. For example: page 1, third line of "author contribution" section: analyses instead of analyzes. Page 2, Abstract section, 8th line: and IL23 (...) is repeated. Page 3, "Introduction" section, lines 12-14: differentiation, maintenance, coordination should be written without article... and other. The title is too generic, I believe that there should be a precise reference to the studied genes.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5317

Title: Susceptibility to ulcerative colitis in Hungarian patients determined by gene-gene interactions

Reviewer code: 00033055

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-29 16:23

Date reviewed: 2013-09-06 20:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

no comment