



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4404

Title: Epirubicin, Cisplatin, 5-FU combination chemotherapy as 2nd line treatment in sorafenib-refractory metastatic hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00158779

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-01 15:03

Date reviewed: 2013-08-17 00:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Lee and co-workers report on a retrospective analysis of combination chemotherapy in HCC patients. Recommendations: The manuscript has to be read carefully by a native speaker in order to improve wording in some parts. A list of abbreviations is needed. Abstract and Introduction: The aim of the study was not clearly stated. The primary endpoint was the overall survival time. This should be clearly pointed out. What does efficacy mean in this context? Statistical analysis: What exactly is the definition of partial response and stable disease? This could be included in table 2. The legend of the table has to be put on the top of the table. Methods: What was the decision matrix to stop or continue treatment every 4 weeks? Results: Table 1: What was the aetiology of the HCC cases? HBV, HCV, alcohol?, please add. Table 3 can be omitted and included in the text. Discussion: It has to be pointed out that the improvement of life expectancy by treatment is minimal in most cases. Thus, in counselling, quality of life parameters should play an important role; this is not mentioned. In addition to the statement of the authors it should be made clear that only a randomised controlled trial can provide reliable data.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4404

Title: Epirubicin, Cisplatin, 5-FU combination chemotherapy as 2nd line treatment in sorafenib-refractory metastatic hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00053439

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-01 15:03

Date reviewed: 2013-08-24 01:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Ji Eun Lee et al report show combination chemotherapy using epirubicin, cisplatin and 5-FU can be used in selective HCC patients who are not responding to serafenib. In this study the authors tried chemotherapy using a combination of epirubicin, cisplatin and 5FU in 31 HCC who were non-responders to serafenib. This combination chemotherapy show improved survival among patients who respond to treatment versus who are non-responders (20.4 months vs 4.9 months). The most common side effect seen among these patients were hematological toxicity including thrombocytopenia and neutropenia. Although the treatment success rate was not so high, the study deserve to be published due to the unique clinical study in humans. There are two concerns noted. 1. Why they did not include drug that inhibits the MDR1 along with the combination chemotherapy. 2. The authors did not pay attention to Figure legend. They are very brief and difficult to understand. This need to be fixed before it is published. Also they are out of place.