

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5129

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00068250

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-18 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-08-23 16:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1 Helicobacter pylori infection is not the main cause but a possible one of gastric cancer development. About 50% of the world population is infected by this bacterium, but only a small portion of the population develops gastric cancer. Multiple factors cause this cancer. The accepted leading etiological factors are N-nitroso-compound and sterigmatocystin in unhealthy food and beverage. 2 In the process of gastric cancer carcinogenesis, we should also treat chronic atrophic gastritis, intestinal metaplasia, even dysplasia, besides gastritis caused by Helicobacter pylori. 3 Page 4 last line, "secondary cancer" is inappropriate but "recurrence" should be used. 4 That recurrence rate of 3-14% after endoscopic resection suggests that current guideline the authors used for endoscopic treatment of early gastric cancer is problematic and needs revision, compared to the recurrent rate after partial gastrectomy, 1.13-1.9%.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5129

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 02445445

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-18 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-08-24 11:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a topic highlight article that discusses the value of H. pylori eradication for the prevention of metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection of early gastric cancer. The article addresses a relevant point, but no novel or innovative data are presented. Presentation and readability of the manuscript are overall satisfactory. I found some expressions rather unconventional ("the H. pylori bacterium" for H. pylori, "the prophylactic prevention" for primary prevention). Also please note that "non-cardiac gastric cancers" should be "non-cardia -or noncardia- gastric cancers". As to the title ("Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer"), it does not accurately reflect the major topic, i.e., the role of H. pylori eradication for cancer prevention. Something like "The role of H. pylori eradication for the prevention of metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer" would be more representative. I suggest edition of the sentence "...gastric cancer can result in field carcinogenesis". It is not cancer that results in carcinogenesis, but carcinogenesis that results in cancer. Because this is a review article, authors should provide a description about how the literature search was performed and which databases (i.e., Pubmed, Medline, Embase, etc) and key-words were used. Without this, we cannot address the completeness and thoroughness of the literature review. It should be declared whether or not any article selection criteria (e.g., based on quality or type) was used.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5129

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 02458758

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-18 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-08-24 21:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript (Topic Review) "Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer" is describing interesting findings and suggests a potential strategy for treatment of early gastric cancer. The authors conclude H. pylori eradication from the residual gastric mucosa after endoscopic resection of early gastric cancer inhibits the development of metachronous gastric cancer; thus, H. pylori eradication is recommended before the progression of gastric mucosal atrophy. But the REFERENCES provided by the authors are isolated, static and one-sided, and it appears that this manuscript have been rushed through in a careless design. There are some suggestions for improving this manuscript. 1. The manuscript is a Topic Review, as we know, the Topic Review must contain latest study of Helicobacter pylori and gastric cancer, but the viewpoint and study in this topic review are old. 2. the Topic Review must contain comprehensive view, but the paper are selective REFERENCES, the author chose the studies which supported the view of H. pylori eradication from the residual gastric mucosa after endoscopic resection of early gastric cancer inhibits the development of metachronous gastric cancer. I can see some studies object to this view, but the studies can't see in this Topic Review. 3. The author reported that H. pylori eradication from the residual gastric mucosa after endoscopic resection of early gastric cancer inhibits the development of metachronous gastric cancer, but such data were not sufficient; it can't get the conclusion; authors had to show more Study on molecular mechanism, and then it can get a whole conclusion. 4. Page 4, The author reported that gastric cancer can result in field carcinogenesis, as the gastric environment is likely to promote the occurrence of secondary cancer. But most readers warn against drawing absolute conclusions from a small-scale study. 5. Authors should do careful language editing before submission. Just a few examples, Page 7 'In summary, in



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

patients who' Obviously such statements should not be appeared in scientific papers, here, have to change to 'In summary, patients who'. A native English speaker is needed to rewrite the whole manuscript.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5129

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 02537576

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-18 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-08-27 14:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review brings forward the relationship between Helicobacter pylori eradication and prevention of gastric cancer after endoscopic treatment for early gastric cancer. This is a hot topic in clinical treatment; however, it's a pity that the author didn't elaborate sufficiently. I feel the manuscript requires some modifications before it can be considered for publication in World Journal of gastroenterology. Major concerns: 1. The review was thought to discuss the H. pylori infection status after endoscopic treatment for early gastric cancer from the title, but in the text, you mainly talked about the relationship between H. pylori eradication and prevention of metachronous gastric cancer, the title cannot convey the author's intent. 2. The framework of the review is a bit confusing; the text should elaborate the relationship between H. pylori infection and gastric cancer recurrence after endoscopic treatment and then turn to the relationship between H. pylori and prevention of metachronous gastric cancer. 3. What's the definition of "metachronous gastric cancer"? 4. A lot of studies about eradication of H. pylori in the prevention of gastric cancer after endoscopic treatment for early gastric cancer were cited, but the results were controversial. 5. The author's comprehension and experience about the prophylactic measure should be introduced into this manuscript. Minor concerns: It is noted that the manuscript needs careful editing so that the goals and results of the study are clear to the reader.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5129

Title: Helicobacter pylori infection after endoscopic submucosal dissection for early gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 02537776

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-18 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-08-30 10:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a good topic which the relationship between Helicobacter pylori eradication and prevention of gastric cancer after endoscopic treatment for early gastric cancer. the manuscript requires some modifications before it can be considered for publication in World Journal of gastroenterology. 1. author mainly talked about the relationship between H. pylori eradication and prevention of metachronous gastric cancer, the title should be changed. 2. author should tell us the definition of "metachronous gastric cancer". 3. author should cite more and newer studies about eradication of H. pylori in the prevention of gastric cancer after endoscopic treatment for early gastric cancer.