

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5946

Title: Establishment of a chronic hepatitis C virus infection: translational evasion of host's oxidative defence

Reviewer code: 02528622

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-06 01:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review paper, Chan S-W., presents a nice review about our current understanding on HCV infection and oxidative stress. Overall, the paper is well written and structured. There are some few issues that need clarification or should be further discussed by the author. 1. Please, define the term quasispecies. There has been a long discussion in the literature regarding the existence of HCV quasispecies (Holmes 2010; Domingo 2012). Eddie and Esteban have both presented arguments against and in favor of the existence of viral quasispecies. In his papers published in 2010, Eddie present different facts suggesting that HCV is unlikely to exist as quasispecies. The author should be encouraged to introduce the definition, so the term is not misunderstood as simple intrahost viral nucleotide variation. 2. What does the author implies with the following sentence "Thus targeting 5' UTR may be a solution to solve the problem of sequence variability"? Is the statement related to therapy, vaccination or molecular detection? Please clarify. 3. The following sentence on page 12 is repetitive "Translation from the HCV is mediated by an IRES". The paper should be revised carefully to avoid redundancy. 4. Conclusions must be rewritten. The conclusions feel more like an introductory section. The author should focus on the main scope of the paper rather than given a vague description of HCV epidemiology, vaccination, therapy and chronicity. 5. The most important limitation of the paper is the lack of a comprehensive molecular section, which is likely to enriched the text significantly. In this section, the author could discuss in detail the participation of genotypes, subgenotypes and so called quasispecies (or viral variants) in the integrity of the IRS structure. While the HCV 5' end is relatively conserved, the nucleotide differences between different genotypes and subgenotypes should be discussed. For instance, HCV genotypes 1 and 4 are more resistant to IFN



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

than other genotypes, can this be related to structural differences in the IRES? Likewise, intrahost variation might result in changes along the 5' end, could these changes affect the integrity of the IRES? Is it possible to have a swarm of different subpopulation with different degrees of replication efficiencies under oxidative conditions? 6. Comparison of the HCV IRES with other flaviviruses (e.g. dengue virus, west nile, etc.) might be interesting. Are all these other flaviviruses capable of taking advantage of oxidative stress to increase their replication rate? How similar or dissimilar the IRES among flaviviruses are? 7. Can substitutions mapped along the HCV IRES use as a regulatory mechanism for viral replication? Can this mechanism be used to slow down or speed up viral replication under particular conditions that can help warrant persistence in the host? 8. There are minor grammatical mistakes spread along the text.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5946

Title: Establishment of a chronic hepatitis C virus infection: translational evasion of host' s oxidative defence

Reviewer code: 00742311

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-30 20:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an article about pathophysiology of hepatitis C infection. The article is well written and the hypothesis makes sense. A basic science approach is adopted, with lots of molecular and cell biology, and only indirect clinical applications. However practitioners need to know some basics as well, as the text is quite readable. The figures have good quality and enhance the text. References are abundant however they demonstrate the care of the authors when reviewing the literature.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5946

Title: Establishment of a chronic hepatitis C virus infection: translational evasion of host' s oxidative defence

Reviewer code: 00503546

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:07

Date reviewed: 2013-11-05 16:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, novel mechanisms explaining chronic HCV infection are given. This information is important and instructive to study the nature of HCV, and activity/treatment of HCV-related disease. Then, this work has enough potential for publication in this form, I think.