

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5996

Title: Kidney transplantation from donors with hepatitis C infection

Reviewer code: 00504928

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:20

Date reviewed: 2013-10-17 03:00:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Commentaries :

The paper concerned a very important subject which is a kidney transplantation. It related advantages and disadvantages for using kidney transplantation from donors infected by hepatitis C. It is a review of literature about the subject with recent references.

Authors discussed all points interesting to the subject, with comparison to kidney transplantation from negative donors for HCV, such as : risk for kidney transplantation with donors infected by HCV, the outcome of patients who were benefited by this type of transplantation, who to treat HCV infection in this case and how to survey patients after kidney transplantation. They, also, proposed an algorithm for this type of patients.

General comments :

- The paper has a great importance in Public Health because it is concerning in particular patients with end-stage renal disease (ESRD) : this affection is very frequent and treatment is based only in kidney transplantation which is difficult to obtain especially if donors infected by HCV are excluded.

- The novelty and Innovation : This review has the advantage to give an algorithm for surveillance of patients treated by kidney transplantation from patients with HCV infection
- Presentation and readability of the manuscript : the paper is not well written in English so it is difficult to read
- Ethics of the research : it is not necessary because the type of the paper (review)

Specific comments :

- Running title : should be modified
- The abstract should be revised ; it is not reflecting well the objective of the paper
- All sections : no specific comments.
- References : updated.

Conclusion :

In conclusion, this manuscript is suitable to be published in the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*. However, the paper is not well written in English ; it is compulsory to review it in its grammatical form.