

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5648

Title: Modern re-appraisal of the validity of the hypothesis of xenobiotic-induced, micronutrient deficient, oxidative stress-mediated cellular injury in chronic pancreatitis: A systematic review.

Reviewer code: 02510721

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-19 18:08

Date reviewed: 2013-09-25 15:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the TITLE is appropriate and reflects the contents of the study. the ABSTRACT gives a clear indications of the objectives and the development of the study. In the INTRODUCTION the Author shows the hypotesis about the role of the oxidative-stress in the pathogenesis of chronic pancreatitis. Consequently it is correct to evaluate if the antioxidant therapy may play a important role in the control of the disease. In this section the Author reports the several and various results that characterize the studies present in the literature. The aim of this study is well indicated. the METHOD of search of papers in the literature is valuable and provides a good basis for the research. The subdivision of the argument in many items with the choice and evaluation of the detailed aspects of the general problems is very useful to understand the complex problem of etiopathology of chronic pancreatitis. In the section "Evidence that exogenous (dietary of medicinal) supplementation..." is well reported the difficulty of the reproduction of the source of chronic pancreatitis and evolution in animal model. Consequently there are great difficulties in interpretation of research's results. The DISCUSSION is well organized and for each item is correctly indicated the level of evidence and the realiability of the reported data. It is in evidence the great difficulty of understanding the results of research in experimental model and also the traslation in a clinical setting. Very valuable the conclusion that "pancreatic acinar cell injury due to short-lived oxygen free radicals...as one of a series of cell-injury mechanisms rather taht a sole mediator". Also in evidence the suggestion to stop the debate about antioxidant therapy in the chronic pancretitis. the REFERENCES are appropriate and updated.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5648

Title: Modern re-appraisal of the validity of the hypothesis of xenobiotic-induced, micronutrient deficient, oxidative stress-mediated cellular injury in chronic pancreatitis: A systematic review.

Reviewer code: 00034432

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-19 18:08

Date reviewed: 2013-09-26 17:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review on this topic. It is balanced and I fully agree with the conclusions. I believe that the manuscript deserves a rapid publication.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5648

Title: Modern re-appraisal of the validity of the hypothesis of xenobiotic-induced, micronutrient deficient, oxidative stress-mediated cellular injury in chronic pancreatitis: A systematic review.

Reviewer code: 02438650

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-19 18:08

Date reviewed: 2013-10-03 23:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Commen for 5648 Oxidative stress, an unbalance between oxidants and antioxidants, produces damage to biomolecules and cells. Oxidative stress has been involved in the pathogenesis of diabetes. Recent studies show that there is a redox regulation of cellular signalling and that the generation of reactive oxygen species leads to the activation of MAP-kinase pathway. This pathway induces the activation of the redoxsensitive transcription factor NF-κB that plays an important role in the regulation of gene activity. This is an interesting review on pathogenesis of chronic pancreatitis. I think this review should be published on World Journal of Gastroenterology.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5648

Title: Modern re-appraisal of the validity of the hypothesis of xenobiotic-induced, micronutrient deficient, oxidative stress-mediated cellular injury in chronic pancreatitis: A systematic review.

Reviewer code: 00181445

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-19 18:08

Date reviewed: 2013-10-06 19:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The pathogenesis of CP is complicated and has not been elucidated clearly. Oxidative stress-induced pancreatic fibrosis is one of the mechanisms. In this manuscript, the authors reviewed the related researches and discussed the rationality of it, especially the necessary of antioxidants medication. Thus it is an interesting topic. But there are still some other comments before its publication: 1/Abstract: the effect of antioxidant should be mentioned in "results". 2/Introduction: this part is a bit long, so it should be better if be shortened. 3/Methods: the search methods and search results should be summarized in a simple way. Other small mistakes: ---The search terms "cytochrome P450" and chronic pancreatitis..... chronic pancreatitis should be "chronic pancreatitis" ---Clinical trials of antioxidant supplementation.....re-appraisal a they have.... 4/Results: "There are differences between Foster's findings and those of Wacke which are attributed by the later authors to the different antibodies used as Foster's study used antibodies raised against rat liver whereas the later study used recombinant human antibodies." This sentence is quite confused.