

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5898

Title: Biomarkers in Inflammatory Bowel Diseases: Current Status and Proteomics Identification Strategies

Reviewer code: 00504581

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 16:18

Date reviewed: 2013-11-02 06:41

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article results very difficult to understand and follow for clinicians or gastroenterologists interested in the clinical practice and not used to the terminology and methodology of this basic research. For instances we missed a much more detailed explanations on the meaning of many terms used in the article such as "proteoforms, promoters, transcriptomes, Transcriptomics, genomics etc.", not well known for clinicians. The authors should think the type of readers of this journal (clinicians) and make the article more readable with the appropriate explanations on all the terminology introduced in the text

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5898

Title: Biomarkers in Inflammatory Bowel Diseases: Current Status and Proteomics Identification Strategies

Reviewer code: 01429020

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-29 16:18

Date reviewed: 2013-12-03 04:15

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|-------------------------|---|----------------|-----------------------------------|
| [] Grade A (Excellent) | [] Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | [] Accept |
| [] Grade B (Very good) | [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing | [] Existed | [] High priority for publication |
| [Y] Grade C (Good) | [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | [] No records | [] Rejection |
| [] Grade D (Fair) | [] Grade D: rejected | [] Existed | [] Minor revision |
| [] Grade E (Poor) | | [] No records | [Y] Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper of Bennike et al emphasizes the growing interest of obtaining reliable new markers of inflammatory bowel diseases both for an early diagnosis and discriminating ulcerative colitis from Crohn's disease. Authors suggest that new insights may be given by Genomic, Transcriptomic and Proteomic Biomarkers. The manuscript is well written and suggests fascinating hypotheses, however some objections may be moved: ? The only biomarkers reported are represented by well known ones (such as RCP, calprotectin, lactoferrin, ASCA and ANCA) which do not completely satisfy clinical purposes, while no novel defined indicator is proposed. For a better understanding of their message, the authors should insert a table with known markers and their significance, sensibility and specificity. Another table with a list of novel markers and significance/perspectives should enrich the message and make pleasant the reading of the manuscript. ? "A likely explanation is that in many cases genomic information alone is not sufficient to describe the complex interactions necessary to fully understand disease etiologies, and in terms of diagnosis, genetics only provide risk factors. Transcriptomics is an extension of genomics, where the transcriptome is sequenced (mRNA characterization), which allows for identifying upregulated genes. However, the protein abundance in the cell does not always correlate with the transcript level, as for example protein turn-over i.e. synthesis and degradation rates is not taken into account". This sentence appears to disappoint the hopes raised from what reported previously. It should be better to modify the text in order to avoid to induce this impression in a reader. ? "Proteomics has been limited mainly by the speed and sensitivity of the mass spectrometers." Also this sentence does not encourage the possibility of finding new biomarkers for inflammatory bowel diseases. ? The expansiveness of the methods used



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

for Genomics. Transcriptomic and proteomic should be considered and a comment is needed. ? “Such biomarkers could be of great diagnostic and prognostic value, and provide a better understanding of the involved disease pathways.” Another sentence where the mountain seems to give birth to a mouse. ? In conclusion, the main objection is that too basic science information is reported and it is very difficult to imagine its application in the clinical practice to obtain novel biomarkers of inflammatory bowel diseases with the ambitious goals to define an early diagnosis and clear differences between ulcerative colitis and Crohn’s disease.