

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7327

Title: The protective effects of intravenous anesthetics for the kidney tissue in obstructive jaundice: an experimental study in bile duct ligated rats.

Reviewer code: 00723766

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 14:26

Date reviewed: 2013-12-01 18:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In Abstract: In this experimental study in rats, we evaluated the protective effects on kidney tissue of frequently used intravenous anesthetics (ketamine, propofol, thiopental, and fentanyl) whose antioxidative properties are well known in oxidative stress in a rat liver model of obstructive jaundice. In Introduction: So that, in this study, we investigated the effects on renal tissues of frequently used intravenous anesthetics (ketamine, propofol, pentobarbital, and fentanyl), in a rat model of oxidative stress caused by OJ through common bile duct ligation. We used these intravenous anesthetics whose antioxidative properties are well known. Intravenous anesthetics has been different, should be corrected. In Discussion: General knowledge has been long, should be shortened. Data of study should be discussed

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7327

Title: The protective effects of intravenous anesthetics for the kidney tissue in obstructive jaundice: an experimental study in bile duct ligated rats.

Reviewer code: 00058327

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 14:26

Date reviewed: 2013-12-10 00:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the submitted report, the authors have analyzed the protective effects of intravenous anesthetics for the kidney tissue in obstructive jaundice. Although these findings may be of interest, there are serious concerns which should be considered. 1. The authors concluded in the abstract, "That among the agents tested, ketamine and propofol generated the least amount of oxidative stress on renal tissues in this rat model of obstructive jaundice created by common bile duct ligation". However, in the manuscript the conclusion is different: "As a conclusion, increased awareness of the potential risk of developing post-operative ARF in OJ, the new approaches in diagnosis and therapy will definitely result in an improvement in the mortality rate observed after surgery for OJ. Please, review. 2. Methodology of antioxidant study was not described in sufficient detail. I'm missing two important control groups: Control and sham-operated group (without obstruction) How the animals were sacrificed after 2 hours? How they were anesthetized to a second laparotomy to sample collection? Were the animals continuously anaesthetized during the entire 2 hours of experimentation? This is not mentioned in the Methods It would be interesting to analyze serum levels of bilirubin, urea and creatinine, and perform a histological study of kidney tissue 3. In Results, the authors cited: "The results showed that the presence of OJ sensitizes the renal tissue to damage under the different anesthetics" but they did not compare with a control. Data should be presented in table or graphics. 4. The discussion is too long. It needs to be shortened being more succinct and specific. Discuss the findings results. 5. References. There several rather old and outdated references quoted in the paper. Please update these wherever possible.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7327

Title: The protective effects of intravenous anesthetics for the kidney tissue in obstructive jaundice: an experimental study in bile duct ligated rats.

Reviewer code: 01076129

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 14:26

Date reviewed: 2013-12-27 00:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper describes how different anesthetics could potentially reduce the risk of acute renal failure in patients with obstructive jaundice by reducing the oxidative stress inflicted by jaundice in combination with acute surgery. The study confirms what has been shown in previous studies. Why the authors chose to perform the study without a pure control group is difficult to understand. Nevertheless, it is of interest and should be of interest to the readers of World Journal of Gastroenterology. It has some minor language errors.