

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6020

Title: A multivariate case-matched comparison between living donor and deceased donor liver transplantation for primary hepatic carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00504602

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 16:36

Date reviewed: 2013-11-03 17:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript was submitted as an Original Article to the World Journal of Gastroenterology, first authored by Ping Wan, originating from Shanghai Jiao Tong University. The authors provide some discussion of differences in survival rates and morbidity/mortality between LDLT and DDLT in the article "A multivariate case-matched comparison between living donor and deceased donor liver transplantation for primary hepatic carcinoma". In my mind, there was significant merit in your work. However, a number of questions and concerns were raised that preclude acceptance in its current form. Methods: The authors diagnosed HCC patients as with or within Milan criteria. The authors need to explain when and how diagnose HCC. (e.g. we diagnosed HCC one month before liver transplantation based on MDCT (Hitachi Medical.....)) The authors focused on biliary complications after LDLT/DDLT, however, they did not mention how to undergo biliary reconstruction (duct-to duct anastomosis of bilioenteric anastomosis, contentious suture or intermitted suture). In addition, the authors should explain how to treat biliary complications. Results: In Table 1, there was data regarding preoperative down-staging treatment. There data is interesting and it should be better to add the data of "how long patients had to wait before transplantation". Discussion: Page 13 line10 The authors described the importance of tumor progression during the period of waiting for graft liver. It's better to refer to the following articles: Chan SC, et al. Wait and Transplant for Stage 2 Hepatocellular Carcinoma With Deceased-Donor Liver Grafts. Transplantation. 2013 Aug 6 Mizuno S, et al. Prospective study on the outcome of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma registered for living donor liver transplantation: how long can they wait? Transplantation. 2010 Mar 27;89(6):650-4.