

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5803

Title: Role of Pomegranate and Citrus fruit juices in Colon Cancer prevention

Reviewer code: 00001114

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-28 10:20

Date reviewed: 2013-10-04 18:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study reviewed the chemoprevention effect of pomegranate and citrus juices against colorectal cancer. I'm really interested in this paper. I have the following comment – 1) I was wondering why the author focused on the fruit juice, not fruit itself. I get the feeling that it is easy to take lots of fruit as juice. If the author consider intake as juice important, comment in Introduction, please. 2) I feel that this review was lack of epidemiological data. Most of this kind of topics was considered based on epidemiological data, for example, dietary fiber, or coffee, etc. And there are some areas where people have lot of intake of those fruit, in particular, citrus fruit. Please provide epidemiological data about the relationship between colorectal cancer and pomegranate and citrus juice. If difficult to show, please discuss the reason in Discussion. 3) I was confusing if pomegranate and citrus juice might be good for the chemoprevention or the treatment of colorectal cancer because of lack of epidemiological data. I feel that the former is suitable for this review even though I understand the mechanism of effect of those fruit juice on colon cancer from in vivo or in vitro study. In addition, title includes cancer prevention, not treatment of colon cancer. But the author state that the clinical trails should be done especially in patients with colon cancer and the effect produced by the oral consumption of the fruit juices must be noted in the last paragraph. So I feel a bit different about that.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5803

Title: Role of Pomegranate and Citrus fruit juices in Colon Cancer prevention

Reviewer code: 00057837

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-28 10:20

Date reviewed: 2013-10-10 16:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review summarizes the current knowledge on pomegranate and citrus fruit juices on colon cancer prevention. I suggest some minor revisions: Fig. 1 is not necessary as pomegranate and citrus fruits are well-known. A table summarizing the most important studies in vivo and in vitro on each substance would improve the overview. A reference should be included: Adhami VM, Khan N, Mukhtar H. Cancer chemoprevention by pomegranate: laboratory and clinical evidence. *Nutr Cancer*. 2009;61(6):811-5. The authors should give an outlook on how to plan and conduct clinical studies (e.g. which population, what numbers needed etc.)