

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8962

Title: A Point Shear Wave Elastography Method for Assessing Liver Stiffness

Reviewer code: 00001097

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-14 12:02

Date reviewed: 2014-01-21 10:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigated A Point Shear Wave Elastography Method for Assessing Liver Stiffness. This paper seems to be important and promising. However, there are some weaknesses that limit the overall message. As indicated below. Major comment 1. In this study, the authors investigated the two study; 1) investigation of intraobserver and interobserver reproducibility of PSWE using iU22 ultrasound system. 2) Diagnostic Accuracy of PSWE. However, these two trials cause confusion and misleadingness to a reader because the sample size is different. The reviewer suggest that the author should change the description of Diagnostic Accuracy of PSWE at first. Because, the sample size of the trial of Diagnostic Accuracy of PSWE is larger than that of investigation of intraobserver and interobserver reproducibility of PSWE. Major comment 2. The cutoff values of equal to or greater than F3, and F4 by Transient elastography were quite lower than that previously reported. Stebbing J et al. reported that the cutoff value for detecting F4 was 15.08 KPa in their meta-analysis (from a total of 22 studies, and 4,430 patients) (J Clin Gastroenterol. 2010;44:214-9). Their result seem to be far apart from your result (cutoff of F4 was 9.3). This is a quit important thing for concerning about the reliability of the data. Minor comment 1. There were several grammatical mistakes. Your article need English proofread by native speaker.