

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8839

Title: Role of 3DCT in laparoscopic total gastrectomy with spleen-preserving splenic lymph node dissection

Reviewer code: 02572355

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-10 21:33

Date reviewed: 2014-01-10 22:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Prof. Chang, I read with vivid interest your paper. I hope it will be accepted for publication. I'm just wondering whether it's possible for you to specify the statistical test used to calculate the significance of your study, since it could sound strange to get a $P=0,000$ when means and DS have such values as you report.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8839

Title: Role of 3DCT in laparoscopic total gastrectomy with spleen-preserving splenic lymph node dissection

Reviewer code: 01560075

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-10 21:33

Date reviewed: 2014-01-11 15:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This retrospective comparative study reveals the role of 3D-CT on of the laparoscopic lymphadenectomy of splenic hilar (#10) LN dissection during gastric cancer surgery. The topic is quite important and the surgical technique is quite good, but several issues should be revised. Major comments 1. Although all the data of this study was collected retrospectively, it is not clearly mentioned in the abstract. Please add the word "retrospective" in your abstract. 2. For which patients, 3D reconstruction was performed? Is there any indication of 3D-reconstruction of abd. CT in authors' institute? Table 5 shows that 3D-CT was constructed in 22 patients even in the earlier phase (<40 Op), and it was not constructed in 59 patients even in the later phase (>40 Op). Please add some explanation in the manuscript. 3. For the results, only intraoperative data were collected. Please add some postoperative data, such as complication, length of stay, blood transfusion, or mortality, even though they were negative. 4. Don't repeat general information of laparoscopic surgery in the introduction and in the discussion. Instead, please add any possible explanations why the difference of intraoperative outcomes was more profound in the thin patients and in the later phase in the discussion. Minor comments 1. Please check the accuracy of reference list. For exaple, no 17. should be corrected to : "Hur H, Jeon HM, Kim W. Laparoscopic pancreas- and spleen-preserving D2 lymph node dissection in advanced (cT2) upper-third gastric cancer. J Surg Oncol 2008, 97:169-72" 2. The surgical technique is quite important, therefore if possible, please add some photos taken during the dissection. (Fog 1 contains only postdissection pictures)