

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7581

Title: Results from clinical trial for esophageal cancer patients treated with thalidomide combined with radiotherapy

Reviewer code: 00039470

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-25 20:26

Date reviewed: 2013-11-26 20:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors stated in this manuscript that EC, one of the most commonly-seen malignant tumors in China, was treated with mainly radiotherapy. They underlined the importance of improvement of radiosensitivity of EC to attain better outcomes. They focused on VEGF as an independent prognostic factor for EC. They pointed out that a high expression of VEGF was indicative for poor radiosensitivity and prognosis of tumors. They investigated if thalidomide play an effective role in those patients treatment via inhibition of VEGF secretion, tumor proliferation and metastasis. This study indicates that thalidomide might improve the radiosensitivity of EC patients with high VEGF expression by down-regulating VEGF level, and finally improve the outcome of radiotherapy. Thalidomide seems to be a good and cheap alternative compared to other currently available anti-angiogenesis drugs include Avastin, Endontain. However, overall survival or local progression free survival are important and are obligatory measures in such studies. Although there is lack of such data in that manuscript, it has still a considerable merit.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7581

Title: Results from clinical trial for esophageal cancer patients treated with thalidomide combined with radiotherapy

Reviewer code: 02485329

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-25 20:26

Date reviewed: 2013-12-03 17:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this is an interesting paper but it needs some revisions; I have criticisms about groups. there is a strong difference in age group. another question: are you sure that the level of VGLF is not correlated with the time in which the radiotherapy is started? I mean, is there a correlation between VGLS value and days of radiotherapy?