

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6348

Title: Liver Transplantation for Malignancy: Current treatment strategies in different regions and the role of living-donor liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 01560464

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 12:48

Date reviewed: 2013-10-28 15:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The review described more in detail the current treatment strategies in different regions and the role of living-donor liver transplantation for liver various malignant diseases, and indicated that the advantages and disadvantages of LT compared with liver resection in treating for liver malignant diseases . The review is important clinical significance to know about advantages and disadvantages of the liver transplantation (LT) for liver malignant diseases . 2) The review need simplify the history of LT , the background of every liver malignant disease, and focus on the various viewpoints of LT for liver malignant diseases near five years .

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6348

Title: Liver Transplantation for Malignancy: Current treatment strategies in different regions and the role of living-donor liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 00054465

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 12:48

Date reviewed: 2013-11-18 23:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an in depth review of the current state of liver transplantation for malignant disease. It is very comprehensive with not only indications, contraindications and outcome data but the authors have discussed the ethics involved with a very balanced view. This manuscript will be an excellent reference for all involved in liver transplantation and managing liver malignancies.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6348

Title: Liver Transplantation for Malignancy: Current treatment strategies in different regions and the role of living-donor liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 02444850

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 12:48

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 16:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review gives a well-founded overview of the topic of liver transplantation for Malignancy. It is highly relevant for the scientific community and covers all aspects of the topic. The language is well written. I only have a few minor points: -1- The aspect of immunosuppression in the case of liver transplantation for malignancy should be discussed in more details in a separate paragraph at the end of the paper, rather than on page 10 lines 6 following. -2- Page 3 line 5: "established" should be replaced by "suggested" -3- Page 4 lines 6: it should be specified if the survival data refer to only the UNOS or ET regions or in general. -4- Table 1: correct typing error: "Epithelioid"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6348

Title: Liver Transplantation for Malignancy: Current treatment strategies in different regions and the role of living-donor liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 00053490

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-14 12:48

Date reviewed: 2013-11-26 10:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors were invited to write a review article to describe indications for liver transplantation in the setting of malignancy. Overall, the authors do a good job with the review. I have some comments: -There are some grammatical errors that will need to be corrected. It is throughout the manuscript, making it somewhat difficult to follow at times. For example, eMELD should mean "exception" MELD, not "exceptional" MELD. UNOS stands for United Network for Organ Sharing. There is no need to say "UNOS network"; this is redundant. Those are just two examples. -On page 8, the authors mention that there were "many retrospective analyses" confirming the validity of the Milan criteria. However, there are no references for the "many" analyses. Please, provide. -There is only brief mention of LDLT in the body of the manuscript (outside Milan criteria, a sentence of fibrolamellar variant of HCC and a paragraph in the CCA section). However, almost half of the conclusion concentrated on the benefits of LDLT. Was that the intention of the authors? There is also only a small paragraph regarding immunosuppression, although this was mentioned prominently in the abstract and conclusion. -Although the discretion lies with the editors, I would refrain from using superlatives to describe individuals and manuscripts. They do not add much to the manuscript.