

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4979

**Title:** Non-platinum-based chemotherapy for treatment of advanced gastric cancer: 5-fluorouracil, taxanes, and irinotecan

**Reviewer code:** 02098400

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-07 20:20

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-08 11:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, the authors review the efficacy and tolerability of non-platinum-based chemotherapy for patients with advanced gastric cancer (AGC). The authors comment on representative non-platinum-based antitumor drugs for AGC and comprehensively review the results of previous clinical trials. This manuscript is well written on the whole, and I have found no points to be revised.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4979

**Title:** Non-platinum-based chemotherapy for treatment of advanced gastric cancer: 5-fluorouracil, taxanes, and irinotecan

**Reviewer code:** 02445548

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-07 20:20

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-09 13:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is relevant to oncologists managing patients with advanced gastric cancer and coherent in the argument for the proposal to consistently consider non-platinum based chemotherapy in view of its equivalent efficacy and lower toxicity profile. Although large trials and certainly RCTs on this subject is lacking, more evidence by way of retrospectively analyses of the available data should be used to provide more evidence, even if each of these analyses focuses on only one part of the equation, such as efficacy or toxicity or tolerability etc.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4979

**Title:** Non-platinum-based chemotherapy for treatment of advanced gastric cancer: 5-fluorouracil, taxanes, and irinotecan

**Reviewer code:** 00001114

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-07 20:20

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-25 18:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper seems platinum agents is too toxic to affect the final treatment outcomes and quality of life for majority of patients with advanced gastric cancer. On the other hand, SPIRITS trial (Lancet Oncol. 2008) showed a survival benefit of S-1 plus cisplatin over S-1 and S-1 plus cisplatin therapy results in the establishment of a standard care for advanced gastric cancer in Japan. Therefore, I feel something different with this review even though I understand that newer agents are considered as a preferred option for first-line chemotherapy in patients with advanced gastric cancer. I have the following comments – I was wondering how the authors evaluate platinum agents play in chemotherapy for patients with advanced gastric cancer. As far as I understand, non-platinum agents were sometimes used alone for chemotherapy in patients with advanced gastric cancer, but platinum agents were usually used as combination with other drugs, not in single agent. Therefore I get the feeling that readers confuse because platinum agents is equally positioned as other cytotoxic agents. Please explain the position of platinum in chemotherapy for advanced gastric cancer.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4979

**Title:** Non-platinum-based chemotherapy for treatment of advanced gastric cancer: 5-fluorouracil, taxanes, and irinotecan

**Reviewer code:** 02441744

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-07 20:20

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-10 05:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good and concise review

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4979

**Title:** Non-platinum-based chemotherapy for treatment of advanced gastric cancer: 5-fluorouracil, taxanes, and irinotecan

**Reviewer code:** 00608195

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-07 20:20

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-11 17:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting review about non-platinum-based chemotherapy of advanced gastric cancer. The paper is written in good English although there are some grammatical incorrections. The discussion is good and clear.