

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7409

Title: Idiopathic mesenteric phlebosclerosis associated with long-term use of medical liquor: two case reports and literature review.

Reviewer code: 00057299

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-16 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-12-03 14:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present manuscript showed clinical data of two Chinese patients with idiopathic mesenteric phlebosclerosis. Including their own patients, the authors summarized clinical data on a total 52 patients that have been reported in English literature. In addition, they suggested the possibility of Chinese medicine as etiological factor. The present case reports are clear and interesting. However, there are major concerns to be clarified before the case report is considered to be published as followings: 1. The manuscript has a lot of linguistic errors and difficult expressions to read. In addition, 'Discussion' section should be concised. 2. Several terms with regard to disease entity or radiological examinations are capitalized in the sentences (for example, Computed Tomography Enterography, Portal Vein CT Angiography, Idiopathic Mesenteric Phlebosclerosis, etc.). In addition, the authors should provide full name of some examinations.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7409

Title: Idiopathic mesenteric phleboscrosis associated with long-term use of medical liquor: two case reports and literature review.

Reviewer code: 00040631

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-16 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-12-24 21:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[] Grade A (Excellent)	[] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[Y] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting report on a relatively rare disease, it is not original, however it may contribute to the knowledge of this topic, mainly its etiology. The PAPER NEEDS TO BE MARKEDLY SHORTENED and THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE SUBSTANTIALLY IMPROVED. ABSTRACT (too long, better shorten it, please delete three-four lines OR the CORE TIP may be titled ABSTRACT and the long abstract deleted) Line 7: better "year" Line 10: "institution" or "department" better than "faculty" Line 11: "also used Chinese..." Line 12: "this patient underwent..." "...postoperative course was uneventful" Line 13: delete from "in addition..to .. furthermore". Just say "We searched etc" Line 16: delete "old" End of the abstract: "we hypothesize that Chinese medicines may play a role in the pathogenesis..." INTRODUCTION (too long) Line 1: better "imaging" than "imageol..." Line 3: "associated with " not "coupled" Line 15: "seen at our department" CASE REPORTS CASE 1 LINE 10: delete from "the" to "Tomography". Just say "TC enterography..." CASE 2 (too long, should be less than 30 lines) Line 1: "was admitted..." not "showed up" Line 2: "An IBD was diagnosed elsewhere and he was treated with sulfasalazine" Line 5: delete "Upon query" Line 7: "for over 12 years" Line 8: "On admission..." Line 15: "colon" not "colons" Line 20: "...an IMP was diagnosed" Line 29: "...performed. The stoma was closed four months later" FIG 3 Line 1: "Visible thrombosis" not "thrombus". "resected" End "...thickened. Calcifications..... are visible" or detectable" DISCUSSION (too long, should be nearly halved) Line 4: "defined" not "deciphered" Delete from "hence" to "questions" Line 12: "rectal bleeding occurred in..." THE LAST PART OF THE DISCUSSION, FROM LINE 67 TO THE END, SHOULD BE HALVED, OTHERWISE THE DISCUSSION IS TOO LONG English language should be strongly revised

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7409

Title: Idiopathic mesenteric phlebosclerosis associated with long-term use of medical liquor: two case reports and literature review.

Reviewer code: 00058448

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-16 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-12-26 08:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting article with description the association of Chinese Herbal Liquor and Mesenteric Phlebosclerosis. The followings are my comments: #1. Does these two patients use same Chinese Herbal Liquor ? #2. Page 4, colonoscopy image. The mucosa is normal in the provided image. Figure e, f is NBI imaging not "purple" mucosa.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7409

Title: Idiopathic mesenteric phleboscrosis associated with long-term use of medical liquor: two case reports and literature review.

Reviewer code: 00068308

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-16 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-12-27 04:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting article addressing a rare condition that needs to be understood by readership in the West too. 1. The paper needs significant language polishing E.G. Replace "imageological" with "imaging or radiological". "Certain chinese medicines may play a role in the pathogenesis" instead of "we ran into consideration that" The patient "showed up" with "was seen with..." 3. The discussion and introduction need to be significantly shortened and repetition avoided. 2. Image shown in Fig 1: d is normal. Images e and f appear to be NBI images, or are they purple mucosa??

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7409

Title: Idiopathic mesenteric phleboscrosis associated with long-term use of medical liquor: two case reports and literature review.

Reviewer code: 00033377

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-16 14:10

Date reviewed: 2013-12-28 02:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[] Grade A (Excellent)	[] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present 2 cases of IMP and perform a literature review on the topic. It is an interesting case report and review. I would suggest the following to enhance the manuscript: The discussion is too long and wordy. Sentences can be deleted or shortened. For example, the fourth paragraph that begins with "When there is a lack of specificity...can be summarized in 1 sentence or 2 at most. The main discussion point should be the possible etiology of the disease and can shorten the clinical, histological sections. You can still provide the reader most of the material in a shorter version. It would be interesting to know if the 16 cases that used Chinese herbs did so before the onset of symptoms. I realize that some case reports may not mention this. The denominator may change sometimes when describing the findings. For example, if not all 52 patients underwent colonoscopy then it should not read 18/52 were found with ulcerative lesions but rather 18/#patients that underwent colonoscopy. There are also too many pictures that are similar to each other, need to choose the most representative ones. It is mentioned that you found 52 cases but there is no mention of how many articles were found, what was the largest case series. In the introduction: "An association with a region-specific lifestyle has been established..." Probably proposed is a better word than established. I assume that case 1 did not go back to using Chinese medical liquor or herbs but should state so. I am not sure I am familiar with some words such as canceration and imageological.