

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6131

Title: Helicobacter pylori eradication for preventing gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 01212971

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-03 22:37

Date reviewed: 2013-10-16 02:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a manuscript analyzing the influence of helicobacter pyloris eradication for preventin gastric cancer. The manuscript is well written, excellent structured and discusses most of the important studies. However, there are to questions that have to be also discussed: 1. What do the authors think why some studies demonstrate an influence of H.P.-Eradication in preventing gastric cancer and some not? 2. The influence of a H.P. Re-infection after eradication is not discussed in the manuscript. Have you found studies analyzing this? Do relatives like husbands/wives/children also have to be eradicated or examined regarding a H.P. infection to reach a successfull eradication? This important topic should be added to the manuscript.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6131

Title: Helicobacter pylori eradication for preventing gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00007903

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-03 22:37

Date reviewed: 2013-10-16 07:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors address a very interesting issue focusing on the main critical question. The paper is well written, the references are appropriately reported. The study contains many valuable clinical messages useful for the readers.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6131

Title: Helicobacter pylori eradication for preventing gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00502797

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-03 22:37

Date reviewed: 2013-10-09 02:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Points of criticism: 1. The authors do not perform a systematic review. 2. The several analyses that are mentioned in the manuscript are randomized controlled trials, retrospective analyses as well as meta-analyses so that the conclusions made are not safe. 3. The questions raised by the authors include a much extended field which is not covered by the review. 4. The manuscript needs a thorough linguistic improvement.