

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6864

Title: Anti-tubercular therapy in patients with Cirrhosis: Challenges and options

Reviewer code: 02527378

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 19:39

Date reviewed: 2013-11-03 23:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors summarize the differences in diagnosis, treatment, monitoring, and hepatotoxicity in treatment of tuberculosis in patients with cirrhosis and suggest the useful treatment of tuberculosis in different grade of cirrhosis. The review is well written and organized. It is acceptable so as it stands.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6864

Title: Anti-tubercular therapy in patients with Cirrhosis: Challenges and options

Reviewer code: 02540655

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 19:39

Date reviewed: 2013-11-12 01:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written review of anti-tubercular treatment in cirrhotic patients, with a well researched review of the literature. I did have a couple of points that I believe would make this paper stronger:

1. The statement that 33% of the world's population, along with 50% of adults in India and Africa is pretty attention grabbing. However, the reference that you provide (WHO 2011), is difficult to verify. Please follow proper guidelines for enumerating references. Was this reference from a journal, book or website?
2. Your introduction paragraph spends too much on describing TB in general, with the last sentence only talking about cirrhotics. Your introduction should be more about introducing the reader to what your paper is about, so please modify accordingly.
3. In the second section (CIDS), second paragraph, you start off by saying what Toll-like receptors can do. Would like to see a sentence describing what TLRs are and on what cells they are found on. Does not read well as is.
4. In the section ATT in cirrhotics - challenges, first para, you refer to WHO guidelines again, but give no reference number. Please correct.
5. In the section "Liver Transplantation", you reference that rifampin should not be used, based on your reference 86. That is not really what the reference says, and considering that was a case report, is not necessarily standard of care. Would be better to state that recipients should be monitored for drug interactions if rifampin is used, or switch to rifabutin, like the references states.
6. You mention that cirrhotics may have a higher incidence of extra-pulmonary manifestations. Is there a difference in treatment protocols based on pulm TB vs. extra pulm TB? If so, would be nice to have a para on this.
7. There are a lot of minor grammatical errors that need to be corrected, for example "Cirrhosis-associated immune dysfunction syndrome is "a" multifactorial in which....