

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5748

**Title:** Outcomes and Management of Viral Hepatitis and HIV Co-infection in Liver Transplantation

**Reviewer code:** 00070481

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-25 12:53

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-28 16:47

| CLASSIFICATION  | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION  |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                                   |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing       | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of                | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)                 | language polishing   | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                           |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |   |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This analysis may be a useful guidance for the treatment of the post Liver transplantation for human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) positive patients with viral hepatitis co-infection

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5748

**Title:** Outcomes and Management of Viral Hepatitis and HIV Co-infection in Liver Transplantation

**Reviewer code:** 00053485

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-25 12:53

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-28 22:13

| CLASSIFICATION  | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing       | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of                | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)                 | language polishing   | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision     |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, Congly et al. summarize the outcomes after transplant in HIV patients with HBV or HCV related end-stage liver disease and recommendations for management. The authors well described important points in particular the pre-transplant factors impacting outcomes in HCV/HIV co-infected candidates. However, there are several unresolved issues in the current manuscript. Major Points 1. Insulin resistance is one of the important pre-transplant factors. Since HCV directly impairs intracellular insulin signaling, insulin resistance seems to be more important factor in HCV-infected patients than in HBV-infected patients. This topic have to be discussed in this review by citing following articles: AIDS. 2012;26:1789-94., Hepatology. 2012;56:2010., Aliment Pharmacol Ther. 2009;30:61-70., World J Gastroenterol. 2006;12:7075-80., J Viral Hepat. 2006;13:449-56., Am J Pathol. 2004;165:1499-508., Gastroenterology. 2004;126:840-8. 2. Cost-effectiveness is an important issue on this field. By addition of this topic, this review would be further improved. 3. One would be interested in the impact of occult HBV and HCV infection on transplantation. 4. For HCV-infected patients, interferon free treatment using oral direct-acting antivirals will be available in near future. This topic is better to be included in the Future Directions section.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5748

**Title:** Outcomes and Management of Viral Hepatitis and HIV Co-infection in Liver Transplantation

**Reviewer code:** 02444863

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-25 12:53

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-05 03:39

| CLASSIFICATION  | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search:                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing       | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of                | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)                 | language polishing   | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Coffin et al describes the outcome of Transplantation in patients with viral hepatitis and HIV. It presents an overview of the existed data in a very nice and understandable way. This manuscript is very well readable for a specialist but also for the general reader.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5748

**Title:** Outcomes and Management of Viral Hepatitis and HIV Co-infection in Liver Transplantation

**Reviewer code:** 00054317

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-09-25 12:53

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-11 04:22

| CLASSIFICATION  | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)                 |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This manuscript describing the transplant management of coinfectd HIV/HBV or HCV end stage liver disease patients is a well written and inclusive yet concise review of the clinical relevant literature and practice. The Clinical subheadings are important and well written and referenced!