

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4949

**Title:** Long-term follow-up of ulcerative colitis patients treated on the basis of their cytomegalovirus antigen status

**Reviewer code:** 00044509

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-05 18:48

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-13 17:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported about the long-term clinical course of UC patients treated the basis of their CMV antigen status. There are some considerations. Major 1. About CMV evaluation, when was CMV antigen status evaluated after starting steroid therapy? And how often was it measured? Once a week? Once two weeks? The authors should describe the time and period of CMV detection. 2. In Table 1, though the CAI in Ag+ group is lower than Ag- group, why is the dose of PSL in Ag+ much higher than Ag- group? In the patient selection, did some kind of bias exist? 3. Figure 1 is complicated. As for 40 CMV-positive patients, did CMV status become all negative regardless of giving GCV or not? 4. In Table 4, the authors listed GCV use for a long-term predictive factor of colectomy. Does it mean CMV negative conversion?

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4949

**Title:** Long-term follow-up of ulcerative colitis patients treated on the basis of their cytomegalovirus antigen status

**Reviewer code:** 00068316

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-05 18:48

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-19 23:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript retrospectively analyzed 118 UC patients to investigate the impact of CMV activation and antiviral therapy based on CMV antigen status on the long-term clinical course of these patients. Furthermore, the relationship between CMV antigen status and the long-term prognosis in UC patients under treatment with appropriate antiviral therapy was identified, the antigen status did not significantly affect it. I have some major concerns about this paper with attachment.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4949

**Title:** Long-term follow-up of ulcerative colitis patients treated on the basis of their cytomegalovirus antigen status

**Reviewer code:** 01588775

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-05 18:48

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-30 04:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

"We showed that patients with CMV infection were less likely to enter remission in the short-term" One could argue that this observation could also be generated by the fact that the authors reduced the steroids dose in CMV positive patients...i believe that this point should be added in their discussion