

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5991

Title: Role of Acupuncture-moxibustion in the Treatment of Irritable Bowel Syndrome: An Update on the Action Mechanism

Reviewer code: 02526197

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:34

Date reviewed: 2013-11-12 11:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article summarizes current understanding of the role of acupuncture-moxibustion in treating IBS. While the topic is important, the following revisions would improve the readability of the article: 1) I would strongly suggest adding a table briefly summarizing the studies. This would increase the clarity and shorten the length of the article. The text in the current version is too long and is poorly-organized. 2) The enteric nervous system plays a critical role in the pathogenesis of IBS. However, the current review didn't provide any evidence regarding acupuncture modification of this mechanism. I suggest adding a paragraph. For example, a study published in Zhongguo Zhen Jiu by Yang HY et al can be discussed. 3) A simple schematic drawing showing the anatomic locations of the points used in the review would be useful and helpful to readers. 4) Please briefly explain the terms Ap, Fp and Fz wherever appropriate. 5) There are many grammar errors.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5991

Title: Role of Acupuncture-moxibustion in the Treatment of Irritable Bowel Syndrome: An Update on the Action Mechanism

Reviewer code: 02567636

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:34

Date reviewed: 2013-11-17 23:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a disjointed, rambling and very selective literature review that sets out to review the role of acupuncture and moxibustion in the treatment of IBS. In reality it becomes a discussion of how acupuncture might affect or does effect many systems that might be involved in IBS, both of which are very speculative. So the review is unhelpful. It would benefit from an explanation of what is involved in the delivery of these therapies to IBS patients and then a systematic review of outcomes of those trials.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5991

Title: Role of Acupuncture-moxibustion in the Treatment of Irritable Bowel Syndrome: An Update on the Action Mechanism

Reviewer code: 02529823

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 13:34

Date reviewed: 2014-01-06 05:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[] Grade A (Excellent)	[] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] Existed	[] Major revision
		[] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present manuscript, the authors concentrated in describing the mechanism of acupuncture-moxibustion for irritable bowel syndrome therapy from the aspect of gastrointestinal motility, visceral hypersensitivity, brain-gut axis, neuroendocrine system and immune system. The authors also indicated the main problems in the therapeutic mechanism research. This review is very interesting and my comments are as below. 1.This manuscript has some spelling mistakes and grammar problems. 2.I would suggest the authors to give a short introduction to acupuncture-moxibustion in the INTRODUCTION section? 3.Though acupuncture and moxibustion are often used together, they are different approaches for disease treatment. Whether all the experimental acupuncture conclusions in the manuscript are based on both of them (acupuncture and moxibustion) or each of them? Why they have to use together or separately if necessary? 4.Can you supply the explanation about the mechanism of regulation of gastrointestinal motility, visceral hypersensitivity, brain-gut axis, neuroendocrine system and immune system through the acupoints?