

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6003

Title: Inflammatory colonic carcinogenesis: a review on pathogenesis and on immunosurveillance mechanisms

Reviewer code: 00070933

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 12:38

Date reviewed: 2013-12-14 03:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

English language should be checked and corrected by a native speaker. The manuscript is rather dense. A couple of figures demonstrating the different pathways leading to cancerization and at least one figure for the evolution of the cancer would be advisable.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6003

Title: Inflammatory colonic carcinogenesis: a review on pathogenesis and on immunosurveillance mechanisms

Reviewer code: 02569700

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 12:38

Date reviewed: 2013-12-18 19:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review "Inflammatory colonic carcinogenesis: a review on pathogenesis and on immunosurveillance mechanisms" by Scarpa et al. is a well written review on clinical data concerning pathologic mechanisms in ulcerative colitis- promoted colorectal cancer (CRC). The review covers genetic aspects such as genomic instability and DNA damage, the role of onco-suppressor genes and apoptosis pathways, and inflammation related enzymes such as Cox-2 and iNOS. One chapter is dedicated to the role of immunosurveillance in inflammation-driven CRC mainly covering the role of CD4+ Tcells. The authors also include own views and opinions within the review. There are some suggestions that may improve the quality of the paper: The manuscript is organized in three chapters. For a reader it may be much easier if the main points of the chapters can be shown in a figure. The review only contains text, figures would help to grasp the essentials quicker. In general, there is a long body of text that could be better organized in sub-chapters and paragraphs to make the reading easier. Mainly literature concerning ulcerative colitis is included but not much about Crohn's disease and CRC. If it was only intended to cover the topic of UC then this should be highlighted in the abstract. Otherwise some information on Crohn and CRC should be included. The role of pro-oncogenic cytokines and transcription factors in inflammation-driven colon cancer is only little covered. It would be good to include a small paragraph that addresses this interesting topic in more detail.