

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7874

Title: Mesothelin promotes cell proliferation in the remodeling of neonatal rat pancreas

Reviewer code: 02849905

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-04 12:01

Date reviewed: 2014-01-17 10:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I believe that the work I have reviewed has important implications in the future as it shows the ability of mesothelin as mediator stimulating the proliferation of pancreatic cells and their possible use in the future. While the exact mechanism of action is not described, no contradictions are observed in utilization and effect relationship . We also observe the presence and action in normal , non-cancerous cells , which also has a high value because it raises the value of the protein but not as oncologic marker, but as a marker of damage and possibly help signal . It would be interesting to establish the relationship between mesothelin , damaged normal cells , and local proliferation of cells but also migration of progenitor cells from bone marrow . This mechanism would put the stamp seal help. The work not only stands out for its findings but also by the detailed methodology . Congratulations !

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7874

Title: Mesothelin promotes cell proliferation in the remodeling of neonatal rat pancreas

Reviewer code: 02445800

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-04 12:01

Date reviewed: 2014-01-19 15:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study the authors investigated the role of mesothelin in development of endocrine pancreas in neonatal rats. One major issue is that the cell line INS-1 is a tumor cell line (insulinoma cell line), not a "normal cell" cell line. The signaling pathways in tumor cells and in normal islets are different, and therefore the results from tumor cell lines can not be used to "explain" observations in normal islets. There are also multiple grammatical errors.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7874

Title: Mesothelin promotes cell proliferation in the remodeling of neonatal rat pancreas

Reviewer code: 00532620

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-04 12:01

Date reviewed: 2014-02-08 20:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors demonstrated that overexpression of mesothelin could promotes beta cell proliferation in vitro while its down-regulation increased the islet number in neonatal rat pancreas. 1. Line 304?306 (p11) are confusing. Why did authors suspect the increased number of small islets in spite of down-regulating mesothelin? Because mesothelin could promote beta cell proliferation, it was more reasonable to expect the decreased number of islets. 2. There seems to be a typo (line 93, p4).