

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7465

Title: Expression of circulating microRNA-218(miR-218) was reduced in gastric cancer and correlated with tumor invasion and prognosis

Reviewer code: 00185438

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-20 19:13

Date reviewed: 2013-12-08 22:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper is very interesting, with a novel approach to the gastric cancer molecular biology. The assay method is of good quality. The number of patients and controls is adequate. However there is some items to improve. - there should be more detailed characteristics of GC patients : N status, resections vs no resection, radicality of surgery, TNM stage. - N status and operability are somewhat commented in discussion, however there is nothing about it in previous sections - The method of staging is commented only in a legend to the table, not in the main text. - The Cox model in table 3 contains limited and selected set of variables (no TNM stage, no radicality, no T stage) and therefore has limited power. Analysis is rather multivariate than multivariable.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7465

Title: Expression of circulating microRNA-218(miR-218) was reduced in gastric cancer and correlated with tumor invasion and prognosis

Reviewer code: 00069199

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-20 19:13

Date reviewed: 2013-12-14 14:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors reported the down-regulation of circulating microRNA-218 (miR-128) in the sera of gastric cancer patients and its correlation with clinical features. Although their findings are interesting, I have several comments for further consideration. 1. In Figure 1, the case number should be included for each comparison. 2. The standard for the low, middle, and high expression of miR-128 should be described in the Methods. 3. Due to the limited case number, the conclusion of this study should be validated by further investigation. Especially, in Table 2, only small case number was compared to draw the conclusion. 4. The English should be edited by a native speaker to correct numerous spelling and grammar errors.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7465

Title: Expression of circulating microRNA-218(miR-218) was reduced in gastric cancer and correlated with tumor invasion and prognosis

Reviewer code: 01003401

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-20 19:13

Date reviewed: 2013-12-17 14:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a carefully done study and the findings are of considerable interest. This is the first report about the expression of miR-218 in serum of GC patients, which may make sense for the diagnosis, treatment and prognosis of gastric cancer. For better understanding of the readers, a few minor revisions listed below may be useful to your study. 1. Fig.1 It would be better if the gap between columns be narrowed, and the title of Y axis should be changed to "miR-218 relative expression". 2. Table 1 "low miR-218 expression(T/N<1.2); middle expression(T/N=1.2-10) ; high expression(T/N>10)". Could you please give us a definition of "T/N"? Also the significance of P value should be elaborated. 3. Para.1, page 6: "The expression level of miR-218 correlated with 3 year survival and stage of the patients." A survival curve of the patients in your studies is needed here to support your point of view. 4. The sentences is hard to understanding: "it miR-218 and miR-34a were considered to function as tumor suppressor miRs" (Line 14-15, page 7) 5. Para. 3, page 8: "From the viewpoint of clinic, low expression of miR-218 might be considered as a risk factor of tumor progression, and thereby a strict systemic therapeutic strategy after operation such as immunotherapy, angiogenesis inhibitor drugs, chemotherapy, and radiotherapy with a regular investigation might improve prognosis." There is a good paper entitled "Self-assembled supramolecular nano vesicles for safe and highly efficient gene delivery to solid tumors" published in "International journal of nanomedicine", in which a simply tailored non-cytotoxic nano vesicle was fabricated and significant potential for use in practical gene therapy was showed. Please cite this paper and evaluate the prospect of gene-therapy using the similar nano-vesicles and the microRNAs including miR-218. 6. It is strongly recommended that a professional reviewer major in Statistics



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

should be invited to review this study.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7465

Title: Expression of circulating microRNA-218(miR-218) was reduced in gastric cancer and correlated with tumor invasion and prognosis

Reviewer code: 01438991

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-20 19:13

Date reviewed: 2013-12-21 10:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Xin et al. evaluated the miR-218 in serum of gastric cancer patients and its correlation with tumor invasion and prognosis. Reduced expression of miR-218 correlated to cancer, histology, metastasis, stage, and prognosis. The results are positive, however, the manuscript was not check-up for mistakes. 1, I cannot find the Kaplan-Meier graph. 2, Results section Line 3: Table 1 is results of miR-218 expression, not "demographic and clinicopathologic variable for the cohort". 3, miR-218 expression and GC features section, Line 2: Table 1 would be Table 2. 4, miR-218 expression and GC features section, Line 7: This way of writing usually means positive relation of expression and tumorigenesis and tumor progression. Write clarifying the negative correlation. 5, Discussion section, Line 7: Again, miR-218 associated with anti-carcinogenesis and cancer anti-development. 6, In total, write the manuscript more carefully, and choose the words to avoid confusing. Carcinogenesis and cancer progression also be thought separately.