

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4851

**Title:** Diagnosis and management of choledochal cyst: 20 years of single Egyptian center experience.

**Reviewer code:** 02439510

**Science editor:** Wang, Jin-Lei

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-29 17:37

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-09 23:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors reported the almost 50 cases of choledochal cyst that located in Asian population. Authors noted surgical management and methods to avoid operative complications including early and late postoperative complications. This study is an interesting case report. However, authors need to pay attention their spelling and grammar's errors. Specific comments are as follows: 1 What is VSD, please give a full name? 2. Figure 2, it is unclear need add more words to explain what is A and B as well as their names. 3. Figure 4, need to show what is A, B as well as white arrow?

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4851

**Title:** Diagnosis and management of choledochal cyst: 20 years of single Egyptian center experience.

**Reviewer code:** 02549814

**Science editor:** Wang, Jin-Lei

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-29 17:37

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-10 10:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good series from Africa and Middle East. However there is no new contribution to medical knowledge of this disease.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4851

**Title:** Diagnosis and management of choledochal cyst: 20 years of single Egyptian center experience.

**Reviewer code:** 02439999

**Science editor:** Wang, Jin-Lei

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-29 17:37

**Date reviewed:** 2013-08-16 10:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments This is a clinical study retrospectively focus on the diagnosis and treatment of choledochal cyst, which is the 20 years single Egyptian center experience. It sounds that is the first study of choledochal cyst come from Africa or Meddle East region to assess the local prevalence of the disease, maybe it is useful for reference, some problems in the manuscript is as follow: (1) The author make a general analysis on the clinical data, but lack of some important information such as the comparasion between the pediatric and adult different. Furthermore, the disease incidence is different in Asian countries and Africa or Middle East region, the author needs to compare them on age, sex ratio, clinical characteristics and so on. That would be more meaningful. If not modified, the article does lack of new ideas. (2) References were relatively old, lack of references of the recent 3 years.