

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6436

Title: HBV and innate immunity

Reviewer code: 00502982

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 14:06

Date reviewed: 2013-10-29 05:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting and timely review review addressing the role of innate immunity in HBV infection. The focus on the involvement of miRNA in the association between HBV and TLR signaling pathways in HBV infection is well chosen.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6436

Title: HBV and innate immunity

Reviewer code: 00006976

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 14:06

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 23:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please consider making the following changes to the text. Abstract, line 2 '...hepatitis and is one...' Abstract, line 11 '... through the interaction with...' Abstract, line 13 'such as the innate...' Core tip, lines 4-6 '...Toll-like Receptors (TLRs)...', '... host immune responses...', '... and reviews the...' Page 5, paragraph 2, lines 4-6. 'TLR3, TLR7/8 and TLR9 aresuch as double-stranded RNA, single-stranded RNA and DNA.' Page 5, paragraph 2, lines 10-12. '...that mediate sensing.....also involved in recognition of pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs).' Page 5, paragraph 3, lines 3-5 and page 6, line 1. Please rephrase this sentence. Page 6, line 2 '...and IRF7 via TRIF inducing...' Page 6, line 4 '...MAPKs initiate...' Page 6, paragraph 2, line 2 '...NF- κ B is activated by three TLR adaptors...' Page 6, paragraph 2, lines 5-7. Please rephrase the sentence beginning 'There...' Page 6, paragraph 2, line 7 '...were also downregulated...' Page 6, paragraph 2, line 8 'after challenge with.....was impaired...' Page 6, paragraph 2, line 13. 'It has also been reported that HBV could target...' Page 6 last paragraph is not clear, please rephrase the last 4 lines on this page. Page 6, line 3. '...core promoter mutations...' Page 6, line 6. '...in persons who...' Page 8, line 1. '...endogenous controls...' Page 8, line 2. '...between the test sample...' Page 8, paragraph 3, line 2 '...HepG2.2.15 compared to...' Page 9, line 4. '...to TLR pathways.' Page 9, line 6. '...through MyD88 in HEK293 cells.' page 9, line 9. 'Thus miR-148/152 can act as fine-tuners...' Page 9, line 13. '...induction by stimulation with...' Page 9, paragraph 2, line 3. '...TLR pathways...' Page 9, paragraph 2, line 3. '...is activated by the...' Page 10, line 2. '...HepG2.2.15 compared to...' Page 10, paragraph 2, line 1-2. '...involved in TLR signalling pathways...' Page 10, paragraph 3. Please rephrase this section.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6436

Title: HBV and innate immunity

Reviewer code: 01566092

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 14:06

Date reviewed: 2013-11-27 15:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Jiang et al., described in this review the relationship between HBV infection and expression of miRNA in human hepatocyte cell lines. They, however, discussed only preliminary relationship between the TLR pathways and cytokines/IFNs output (Fig. 1). The manuscript suffers severely from the lack of a clear picture of how HBV triggers innate responses. It was difficult for readers to understand why the miRNA expression profiles link the outcome of the innate immune system. The points in the text were frequently out of the scope. Therefore, it is suggested that the authors emphasize the role of miRNAs in response to HBV infection and provide adequate elaboration on this topic.

1. The focus of this review and the title are diverged. "Regulation of miRNA by HBV infection and their possible association with control of innate immunity" would be more suitable as a title; In that case, however, the references do not always reflect HBV and innate immunity.
2. Their result "showed that HBV persistently infects hepatocytes through the regulation of miRNAs" (page 2 line18; page 10 line6). This is an over-interpretation.
3. In addition, it is inappropriate trying to include material/result in the writing of a review.
4. The explanation on the cytokines are scattered with very little solid facts on how these cytokines suppress HBV. Similar tendency is found in the elaboration of association between HBV and TLRs. Authors have to screen appropriate literatures.
5. Although they mentioned the regulation of type I IFN, they poorly depicted the TRIF/TICAM-1 and MAVS/IPS-1 pathways, which are major pathways for type I IFN induction, rather than the MyD88 pathway.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6436

Title: HBV and innate immunity

Reviewer code: 00502943

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 14:06

Date reviewed: 2013-11-29 02:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] Existed	[] Major revision
		[] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review focuses on the involvement of miRNA in the association between HBV and TLR signaling pathways. . The items are well discussed and the bibliography is appropriate.