

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6715

Title: Impairment of Innate Immune Responses in Cirrhotic Patients and Treatment by Branched-Chain Amino Acids

Reviewer code: 01560505

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:37

Date reviewed: 2013-11-14 02:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The author shown the detail of functional abnormalities in neutrophils. However, the explanation of NK cells seem less. Please let us know the reason why the NK cell show decrease the activity in liver cirrhosis patients. 2. As for the treatment of HCC by BCAA, author cited a multicenter, randomized study(is it a meta analysis?) to support it and shown decreased the incidence of HCC. Can you show us the possible mechanism of prevention HCC genesis? Only because improve the immunologic surveillance? Hyperinsulinemia is just one of risk factors. 3. Some abbreviations didn't show the full words in the paper(like PMNs(polymorphonuclear)).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6715

Title: Impairment of Innate Immune Responses in Cirrhotic Patients and Treatment by Branched-Chain Amino Acids

Reviewer code: 00506513

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:37

Date reviewed: 2013-12-13 16:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review concisely summaries efficacy and possible mechanisms of BCAA treatment on cirrhotic patients. This is well written. However, I comment as follows: 1. Brief introduction for BCAA, such as natural source, constituents and chemical structure, should be provided. 2. Fig. 1 is not significant. Alternatively, a figure (or a table), which summarizes “impairment of innate immune response in cirrhotic patients” and “impairment of adaptive immune response in cirrhotic patients” sections. 3. Several grammatical errors are found. The author should check again.