



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6818

Title: HEPATITIS B TRANSMISSION BY CELL AND TISSUE ALLOGRAFTS: HOW SAFE IS SAFE ENOUGH?

Reviewer code: 02566475

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-29 19:35

Date reviewed: 2013-10-29 23:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, Congratulation for your manuscript. It's a high quality material that I recommend for publication in its present form. Yours Sincerely, Miklos Weszli



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6818

Title: HEPATITIS B TRANSMISSION BY CELL AND TISSUE ALLOGRAFTS: HOW SAFE IS SAFE ENOUGH?

Reviewer code: 00036837

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-29 19:35

Date reviewed: 2013-11-02 03:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6818 (WJG)

Title: HEPATITIS B TRANSMISSION BY CELL AND TISSUE ALLOGRAFTS: HOW SAFE IS SAFE ENOUGH? by P.Solves et al.

GENERAL COMMENTS

1. Introduction.

This section is too generic. After reading it, the reader is likely to gain an insufficient introduction to this subject because quantitative findings are largely missing and, furthermore, the exact meaning of some adjectives (e.g. "very rare") remains obscure (unless the reader decides to read all the full texts of the referenced papers).

2. Donor screening

This section is also too generic. Quantitative information is lacking, and the only information that is presented is essentially represented by the opinions of the authors.

3. Donor testing: general considerations

The authors do not indicate the evidential basis from which they have derived these considerations.

4. Overall impression from the entire manuscript.

The quality of this paper is uniformly low.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS

- a) Page 2, Abstract: The abstract describes only the purposes of this review, whereas the reader would expect to find the main findings that the authors have obtained from their literature overview.
- b) Page 3, line 9: why “disease infectious”?
- c) Page 4, line 2: is musculoskeletal allograft really the most demanded tissue?
- d) Page 4, first paragraph: it is unclear whether these findings refer to “musculoskeletal allografts” and/or “allografts of several kind(s) of tissue” and/or “tissue allografts”.
- e) Page 5, line 9: “is assumed” is quite unclear: more importantly, the authors do not state the precise settings to which these consideration refer (e.g. which countries?).
- f) Page 6, line 9: references are usually indicated in numerical order.
- g) Page 6, line 18: what is an “important number”?
- h) Page 6: line 5 from the bottom: please, briefly describe what this sequential algorithm is.
- i) Page 7, line 10: “sense” could be replaced by a better term
- j) Page 8, lines 10 and 11 from the bottom: please correct “is well established” and “whether must be made” which are both grammatically incorrect.
- k) Page 9, line 2: please correct “raising question”.
- l) Page 9, line 7: it is infrequent that “a scandalous possibility” remains unsettled for nearly 10 years; in fact, reference 33 dates back to 2004.
- m) Page 9, last paragraph from “In summary, ...” to “is routinely performed”. There are no references. Who suggests that this strategy of “optimum screening” is optimal?
- n) Page 10, first paragraph: the findings by Tugwell should be described more clearly.
- o) Page 11: FMEA and MECA are not supported by any references.
- p) Page 13: In citing the experience of Project Notify, the authors do not explain in sufficient detail what the “global interface” is.
- q) Page 14: Please provide some references to the “guides” issued by the FDA.
- r) Page 15: the strategies proposed by the authors are not sufficiently supported by the literature mainly because the available literature has been insufficiently reviewed in this paper.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6818

Title: HEPATITIS B TRANSMISSION BY CELL AND TISSUE ALLOGRAFTS: HOW SAFE IS SAFE ENOUGH?

Reviewer code: 02538801

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-29 19:35

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 11:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written manuscript reviewing the risk on hepatitis B virus transmission by cell and tissue transplantation, comprehensively discussing several potential sources of transmission and suggesting some strategies to decrease it. The author collected the information from all the related up-to-date literatures and the manuscript is well organized and written in fluent english with great respect to specific readers. Minor revision: Line 3 page 9, the first period should be deleted. I could not contribute more to make this manuscript better and strongly suggest the publication in its prime form. I could not contribute more to make this manuscript better and strongly suggest the publication in its prime form.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6818

Title: HEPATITIS B TRANSMISSION BY CELL AND TISSUE ALLOGRAFTS: HOW SAFE IS SAFE ENOUGH?

Reviewer code: 02538801

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-29 19:35

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 11:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written manuscript reviewing the risk on hepatitis B virus transmission by cell and tissue transplantation, comprehensively discussing several potential sources of transmission and suggesting some strategies to decrease it. The author collected the information from all the related up-to-date literatures and the manuscript is well organized and written in fluent english with great respect to specific readers. Minor revision: Line 3 page 9, the first period should be deleted. I could not contribute more to make this manuscript better and strongly suggest the publication in its prime form. I could not contribute more to make this manuscript better and strongly suggest the publication in its prime form.